

LEGISLATIVE ACTION

Senate House

Comm: RCS 11/16/2011

The Committee on Rules (Gardiner) recommended the following:

Senate Amendment (with title amendment)

Delete everything after the enacting clause and insert:

Section 1. The facts stated in the preamble to this act are found and declared to be true.

Section 2. The Sheriff of Broward County is authorized and directed to appropriate from funds of the Broward County Sheriff's Office not otherwise appropriated and to draw a warrant payable to the Guardianship of Eric Brody for one-half of all amounts that remain unpaid in accordance with the final judgment, plus the cost judgment, in the sum of \$15,575,021.30 as compensation for injuries and damages sustained as a result

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15 16

17 18

19

20 21

22

23

24

25 26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34 35

36

37 38

39

40

41

42



of the negligence of the Broward County Sheriff's Office. Section 3. The amount to be paid by the Broward County

Sheriff's Office pursuant to s. 768.28, Florida Statutes, and the amount awarded under this act are intended to provide the sole compensation for all claims arising out of the facts described in this act which resulted in the injuries to Eric Brody. The total amount of attorney's fees, lobbying fees, costs, and other similar expenses may not exceed 25 percent of the total amount awarded under section 2 of this act.

Section 4. It is the intent of the Legislature that onehalf of the lien interests held by the state resulting from the treatment and care of Eric Brody for the events described in the preamble of this act are not waived and extinguished, and the claimant's guardianship shall reimburse the state for one-half of the expenses of Medicaid, Medicare, or the Agency for Health Care Administration pursuant to s. 409.910, Florida Statutes. The claimant's guardianship shall pay the amount due pursuant to this act prior to distributing any funds to the claimant.

Section 5. This act shall take effect upon becoming a law.

======== T I T L E A M E N D M E N T ========== And the title is amended as follows:

Delete everything before the enacting clause and insert:

> A bill to be entitled An act for the relief of Eric Brody by the Broward County Sheriff's Office; providing for an appropriation to compensate Eric Brody for injuries sustained as a result of the negligence of the Broward



County Sheriff's Office; providing a limitation on the payment of fees and costs related to the claim against the Broward County Sheriff's Office; providing legislative intent regarding lien interests held by the state; requiring that the guardianship pay a portion of such liens before distributing funds to the claimant; providing an effective date.

50 51

52

53

54

55

56

57

58 59

60

61 62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

43

44 45

46 47

48 49

> WHEREAS, on the evening of March 3, 1998, 18-year-old Eric Brody, a college-bound high school senior, was returning home from his part-time job at the Sawgrass Mills Sports Authority. Eric was driving his 1982 AMC Concord eastbound on Oakland Park Boulevard in Sunrise, Florida, and

WHEREAS, that same evening, Broward County Sheriff's Deputy Christopher Thieman, who had been visiting his girlfriend and was running late for duty, was driving his Broward County Sheriff's Office cruiser westbound on Oakland Park Boulevard. At the time he left his girlfriend's house, Deputy Thieman had less than 15 minutes to travel 11 miles to make roll call on time, which was mandatory pursuant to sheriff's office policy and procedure, and

WHEREAS, at approximately 10:36 p.m., Eric Brody began to make a left-hand turn into his neighborhood at the intersection of N.W. 117th Avenue and Oakland Park Boulevard. Deputy Thieman, who was driving in excess of the 45-mile-per-hour posted speed limit and traveling in the opposite direction, was not within the intersection and was more than 430 feet away from Eric Brody's car when Eric Brody began the turn. Eric Brody's car cleared two of the three westbound lanes on Oakland Park



Boulevard, and

72

73

74

75

76 77

78

79

80

81

82

83

84

85

86

87

88 89

90

91

92

93

94 95

96

97

98

99 100

WHEREAS, Deputy Thieman, who was traveling in the inside westbound lane closest to the median, suddenly and inexplicably steered his vehicle to the right, across the center lane and into the outside lane, where the front end of his car struck the passenger side of Eric's car with great force, just behind the right front wheel and near the passenger door, and

WHEREAS, Deputy Thieman testified at trial that although he knew that the posted speed limit was 45 miles per hour, he refused to provide an estimate as to how fast he was traveling before the crash, and

WHEREAS, in the course of the investigation, the Broward County Sheriff's Office lost key evidence from the crashed vehicles and did not report any witnesses even though the first responders to the crash scene were police officers from the City of Sunrise, and

WHEREAS, the Broward County detective who led the crash investigation entered inaccurate data into a computerized accident reconstruction program which skewed the speed that Deputy Thieman was driving, but, nevertheless, determined that he was still traveling well over the speed limit, and

WHEREAS, accident reconstruction experts called by both parties testified that Deputy Thieman was driving at least 60 to more than 70 miles per hour when his vehicle slammed into the passenger side of Eric Brody's car, and

WHEREAS, Eric Brody was found unconscious 6 minutes later by paramedics, his head and upper torso leaning upright and toward the passenger-side door. Although he was out of his shoulder harness and seat belt by the time paramedics arrived,

102

103

104

105

106

107

108

109

110

111

112

113

114

115

116

117

118

119

120 121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129



the Brody's attorney proved that Eric was wearing his seat belt and that the 16-year-old seat belt buckle failed during the crash. Photographs taken at the scene by the sheriff's office investigators showed the belt to be fully spooled out because the retractor was jammed, with the belt dangling outside the vehicle from the driver-side door, providing proof that Eric Brody was wearing his seat belt and shoulder harness during the crash, and

WHEREAS, accident reconstruction and human factor experts called by both the plaintiff and the defendant agreed that if Deputy Thieman been driving at the speed limit, Eric Brody would have easily completed his turn, and

WHEREAS, the experts also agreed that if Deputy Thieman simply remained within his lane of travel, regardless of his speed, there would not have been a collision, and

WHEREAS, in order to investigate the seat-belt defense, experts for Eric Brody recreated the accident using an exact car-to-car crash test that was conducted by a nationally recognized crash test facility. The crash test involved vehicles identical to the Brody and Thieman vehicles, a fully instrumented hybrid III dummy, and high-speed action cameras, and

WHEREAS, the crash test proved that Eric Brody was wearing his restraint system during the crash because the seat-belted test dummy struck its head on the passenger door within inches of where Eric Brody's head actually struck the passenger door, and

WHEREAS, when Eric Brody's head struck the passenger door of his vehicle, the door crushed inward from the force of the

131

132 133

134 135

136

137

138

139

140

141

142 143

144 145

146

147

148

149 150

151

152

153

154

155

156

157 158



impact with the police cruiser while at the same time his upper torso was moving toward the point of impact and the passenger door. The impact resulted in skull fractures and massive brain sheering, bleeding, bruising, and swelling, and

WHEREAS, Eric Brody was airlifted by helicopter to Broward General Hospital where he was placed on a ventilator and underwent an emergency craniotomy and neurosurgery. He began to recover from a deep coma more than 7 months after his injury and underwent extensive rehabilitation, having to relearn how to walk, talk, feed himself, and perform other basic functions, and

WHEREAS, Eric Brody, who is now 32 years old, has been left profoundly brain-injured, lives with his parents, and is mostly isolated from his former friends and other young people his age. His speech is barely intelligible and he has significant cognitive dysfunction, judgment impairment, memory loss, and neuro-visual disabilities. Eric Brody also has impaired fine and gross motor skills and very poor balance. Although Eric is able to use a walker for short distances, he mostly uses a wheelchair to get around. The entire left side of his body is partially paralyzed and spastic, and he needs help with many of his daily functions. Eric Brody is permanently and totally disabled; however, he has a normal life expectancy, and

WHEREAS, the cost of Eric Brody's life care plan is nearly \$10 million, and he has been left totally dependent on public health programs and taxpayer assistance since 1998, and

WHEREAS, the Broward County Sheriff's Office was insured for this claim through Ranger Insurance Company and paid more than \$400,000 for liability coverage, and

WHEREAS, on December 1, 2005, after a 2-month trial, a

160

161

162

163 164

165

166 167

168

169

170

171 172

173 174

175

176 177

178

179

180

181 182

183

184

185

186



Broward County jury consisting of three men and three women found that that Deputy Thieman and the Broward County Sheriff's Office were 100 percent negligent, and Eric Brody was not comparatively negligent, and

WHEREAS, the jury found Eric Brody's damages to be \$30,609,298, including a determination that his past and future care and other economic damages were \$11,326,216, and

WHEREAS, final judgment was entered for \$30,609,298, and the court entered a cost judgment for \$270,372.30, for a total of \$30,879,670.30, and

WHEREAS, the court denied the Broward County Sheriff's Office posttrial motions for judgment notwithstanding the verdict, new trial, or remittitur, and

WHEREAS, the insurer of the Broward County Sheriff's Office retained appellate counsel and elected to appeal the final judgment but not the cost judgment, and

WHEREAS, the Fourth District Court of Appeal upheld the verdict in the fall of 2007, and

WHEREAS, the insurer of the Broward County Sheriff's Office subsequently petitioned the Florida Supreme Court to seek another appeal, but the petition was denied in April of 2008, and

WHEREAS, all legal remedies for all parties involved have been exhausted and this case is ripe for a claim bill, and

WHEREAS, the Broward County Sheriff's Office has paid \$200,000 pursuant to s. 768.28, Florida Statutes, and the amount of \$15,575,021.30 is sought through the submission of a claim bill to the Legislature, NOW, THEREFORE,