

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SENATE REDISTRICTING SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING
MONDAY, OCTOBER 17, 2011

Transcribed by:
CLARA C. ROTRUCK
Court Reporter

1 T A P E D P R O C E E D I N G S

2 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: All right, here we
3 go. All right. The Senate Redistricting
4 Subcommittee is now called to order -- called
5 to order. Thank you.

6 All right. Katie, please call the roll
7 and announce the presence of a quorum.

8 THE CLERK: Representatives Boyd?

9 REPRESENTATIVE BOYD: Here.

10 THE CLERK: Caldwell?

11 REPRESENTATIVE CALDWELL: Here.

12 THE CLERK: Crisafulli?

13 REPRESENTATIVE CRISAFULLI: Here.

14 THE CLERK: Cruz?

15 REPRESENTATIVE CRUZ: Here.

16 THE CLERK: Ford?

17 Hukill?

18 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Here.

19 THE CLERK: Jenne?

20 REPRESENTATIVE JENNE: Here.

21 THE CLERK: Kiar?

22 REPRESENTATIVE KIAR: Here.

23 THE CLERK: Logan?

24 REPRESENTATIVE LOGAN: Here.

25 THE CLERK: Nehr?

1 REPRESENTATIVE NEHR: Here.

2 THE CLERK: Rouson?

3 REPRESENTATIVE ROUSON: Here.

4 THE CLERK: Stargel?

5 Williams, A.?

6 Williams, T.?

7 REPRESENTATIVE T. WILLIAMS: Here.

8 THE CLERK: Workman?

9 REPRESENTATIVE WORKMAN: Here.

10 THE CLERK: Quorum is present, Madam
11 Chair.

12 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: All right.

13 Representatives Ford and Stargel have an
14 excused absence.

15 Members, at the end of our last meeting,
16 we discussed how to go forward with meeting
17 Chair Weatherford's request for producing three
18 options, complete options, for State Senate
19 maps in order that we can provide these options
20 to the redistricting committee in a timely
21 manner. Last meeting I raised the point that I
22 believe we need to see essentially the
23 either/or's of each region, in other words, the
24 key decision points of each region, in order
25 that we craft these options. Representative

1 Kiar raised the point that we need to look at
2 specific options for minority communities.

3 Today our staff will be presenting us with
4 these options so that we can discuss them, ask
5 questions and make suggestions. It is possible
6 that the materials in your packet will be more
7 than today's meeting to finish -- will take
8 more than today's meeting to finish.
9 Furthermore, if you have suggestions or
10 requests for additional information, that, too,
11 may be the subject of the next meeting.

12 It is my intent and co-Chair Nehr's intent
13 that the information from today and our next
14 meeting, including both the materials being
15 presented and the collective input of the
16 subcommittee, will be fashioned into
17 approximately three to five PCBs. Along with
18 any member bills that are filed, we could be
19 work-shopping these PCBs during the
20 November 14th interim committee week and
21 possibly beyond.

22 I say all this to make the point that what
23 really happens here is very important, your
24 input is important. If you have any thoughts
25 or suggestions or questions, now is the time to

1 raise these points. This meeting, next
2 meeting, in between meetings, if you wish to
3 talk to myself or Chair Nehr or with our staff,
4 please do that.

5 And with that said, members, are there any
6 questions?

7 If there are no questions, now we will
8 hear today's presentation from our staff
9 director, Alex Kelly. Members, if you have any
10 questions during his presentation, just please
11 catch my attention, and I will stop him at the
12 next appropriate time so that we can ask
13 questions.

14 And with that, Mr. Kelly, you are
15 recognized to address the Committee.

16 MR. KELLY: Thank you, Madam Chair.

17 And, members, as Chair Hukill noted, we
18 are going to go through sort of a series of
19 either/or options in the different regions of
20 the state -- in some cases, a couple of
21 options; in some cases, three or four
22 options -- and take a look at the different
23 suggestions where they possibly differ from
24 each other, where they possibly can work
25 together, and then what other type of effects

1 the different public suggestions and sort of
2 the thoughts from those suggestions create and
3 the opportunities they give you in terms of
4 crafting the Senate maps.

5 Just starting broadly to give you a sense
6 of how the different regions of the state work
7 together -- and I should say, on page two now
8 in the packet, the map of the state that has 11
9 of the counties shaded, the map shows the
10 counties that must just by virtue of their
11 population be split, and we tend to see a
12 clustering of those counties in the I-4
13 corridor. By virtue of that, in all
14 likelihood, your most difficult decisions with
15 the Senate map are also going to occur in the
16 I-4 corridor, because looking at this page and
17 also looking at the next page, you will see
18 that Florida's population is shifting towards
19 the middle of the state, for the most part,
20 some to the southwest, some to the St. Lucie
21 and Martin County areas, but, again, much of
22 the state is shifting to the middle, so the
23 reality is there will be a greater percentage
24 of the districts that are somehow associated
25 with central Florida, and, again, that is where

1 probably the tougher decisions will be made.

2 Moving to the next slide, to get into
3 specifically northwest Florida, first this
4 slide just shows the districts that are in
5 northwest Florida today. Today one of those
6 seats, District 6, the green district, is a
7 30 percent -- has a 30 percent African-American
8 voting age population. None of those seats are
9 effective minority districts in that sense, but
10 still in the process of redrawing district
11 boundary lines, if at the beginning of the
12 process you have a district that has a
13 30 percent African-American population, it is
14 something to consider that at the end of this
15 you may still want to have something close to
16 that.

17 In looking at some of the suggestions that
18 were submitted by the public, the first
19 suggestion and the first, I guess, option, if
20 you will, for the Panhandle and how to draw
21 Senate districts, this is a drawing of
22 horizontal districts. This is submission
23 number seven received by the Legislature. And
24 coming back to the point about the minority
25 population in the Panhandle, this map, this set

1 of districts, achieves the purpose of still
2 keeping that community together and, frankly,
3 looks similar to the current maps. The one
4 noticeable difference from the current maps to
5 this is this in Walton County keeps all of
6 Eglin Air Force Base in the southern district
7 that essentially runs along Highway 98 --
8 Highway 98, and that way acts as an artery for
9 the district. So, again, this is -- this would
10 be an option for drawing horizontal districts
11 that separate coastal communities from more
12 rural communities.

13 Looking at the next map that was
14 submitted, this is map number 64, and it is
15 page six in your packet, the map here,
16 relatively speaking, follows county boundary
17 lines in the Panhandle, what some may refer to
18 as vertical districts. The difference between
19 the first and second district is the City of
20 Crestview is drawn into the orange district and
21 drawn out of the others. So the map drawer who
22 submitted this used the city boundary line as a
23 way to divide the districts.

24 Moving on to the next suggestion, we have
25 coined this a vertical horizontal hybrid. The

1 way that the map drawer did their work, they
2 used Pensacola as a whole. They actually --
3 the first map divided Pensacola. This map did
4 not, it kept Pensacola whole, albeit it divides
5 Escambia County. So the map drawer used the
6 City of Pensacola to essentially anchor the
7 seat and provide its major population. And
8 then for the second district, the map drawer
9 used Panama City as a way, again, to anchor the
10 seat and give it a major population center.
11 And then for the third district and moving west
12 to east, the map drawer used Tallahassee as
13 that major population center. And throughout
14 the presentation we use that term, "anchoring,"
15 as a way just to refer to a major population
16 source within a district, and in all
17 likelihood, it could be potentially the
18 controlling population in the district.

19 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Representative
20 Kiar, you are recognized.

21 REPRESENTATIVE KIAR: Thank you, Madam
22 Chair.

23 I just -- I'm -- anchoring just for my own
24 clarification purposes. So, for example, if
25 there is a district here where we are right

1 now, and a large portion of the population,
2 let's say it would be, you know, where the
3 university is and downtown, that would be
4 considered anchoring, utilizing that part?

5 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: You are
6 recognized.

7 MR. KELLY: Thank you, Madam Chair.

8 It is a term we made up in-house, but,
9 yeah, if the major population center of the
10 district happens to be that community, then,
11 yes, we refer to it as the anchor for that
12 district. And that may be looked at a couple
13 of different ways. If you are talking about,
14 let's say, Palm Beach County and a district
15 that 10 percent of it maybe goes into Martin
16 County, well, Palm Beach County as a whole may
17 be what we refer to as the anchor of the
18 district. But when you talk about rural
19 counties and then one major city, that major
20 city may have a population of 100,000 people.
21 The district maybe is five times that size, but
22 that population of 100,000 people is still the
23 most significant concentration of people in the
24 district, and so it is likely to have great
25 influence over the district.

1 REPRESENTATIVE KIAR: Thank you, Madam
2 Chair.

3 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Follow-up?

4 REPRESENTATIVE KIAR: No, thank you.

5 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: All right.

6 Members, any other questions at this point?

7 All right, there being none, proceed, Mr.
8 Kelly.

9 MR. KELLY: Thank you, Madam Chair.

10 The next slide is more just for your
11 reference, and it is page eight in the packet.
12 The slide shows two visuals. One, when you
13 look at the Panhandle, the coastal cities tend
14 to be the more populated cities. The rural
15 cities tend to be smaller. If you were going
16 to use the principle that to some degree
17 separated coastal from rural communities, your
18 rural district, just by virtue that it has to
19 be -- has to have a much larger geography
20 because you get your population much quicker
21 along the coastal communities.

22 And the other visual just identify the
23 three largest population centers by county in
24 the Panhandle, although by city you would
25 include the City of Tallahassee there, but by

1 county -- I'm sorry, Leon County is
2 highlighted, but the most major population
3 centers in the Panhandle.

4 Now, previously we mentioned that you have
5 to split eight counties -- or, I'm sorry, 11
6 counties statewide just by virtue of the
7 population. In the Panhandle, because of the
8 geography, you have to, no matter what, split
9 Walton County as well simply because whether
10 you draw horizontal or vertical districts, in
11 Walton County, you are going to meet a
12 population point just because physically,
13 obviously, you can't go north or south of the
14 county, and so Walton County has to be divided
15 in the map as well.

16 Moving on to northeast -- north central
17 Florida, again taking a quick look at the
18 current map, the main point to make here is
19 that there is a minority access seat in this
20 region, Senate District 1, which does
21 traditionally elect African-American
22 candidates, and that is the seat beginning in
23 Duval County and going all the way down into
24 Volusia County.

25 The other point to mention about this

1 region of the state is Senate District 20,
2 which is essentially at the bottom of the
3 region. It is the purplish district that is in
4 Lake, Marion, Volusia Counties. That district
5 is significantly over-populated, so parts of
6 that district are going to have to go into
7 another district simply because of population.
8 It is over 20 percent over-populated.

9 So in terms of northeast Florida, there
10 were a few decision points that stuck out from
11 the public input as things to consider that are
12 sort of lynchpin type issues as to how you
13 might craft the Senate maps in this part of the
14 state. The first was how you treat the rural
15 communities and whether -- again, actually
16 coming back to the anchoring point, whether
17 your rural communities are tied to at least one
18 urban center or whether they are unto
19 themselves, and the individuals who submitted
20 maps tended to vary as to what they submitted.
21 On page ten, the slide in front of you is an
22 example of a district that is mostly rural
23 communities; however, it has the City of
24 Gainesville in the district, so there is one
25 major population center in a district that is

1 otherwise very rural.

2 Moving on to the next slide, this is an
3 example of a district that was submitted that
4 is predominantly all rural counties, and in
5 this case, there is not one significant
6 population center as compared to the rest of
7 the district, which is important, because as
8 you will see, the population, of course, tends
9 to be along the coast. The population in this
10 region tends to be in Marion County, Lake
11 County, Volusia, Duval. So how you deal with
12 the more rural counties is important, whether
13 you have to split them into two or whether you
14 can put them into one district.

15 The next point that came up frequently
16 about this region that --

17 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Representative
18 Jenne.

19 REPRESENTATIVE JENNE: Thank you, Madam
20 Chair.

21 Mr. Kelly, just a quick question, and I
22 realize that the answer will probably be
23 somewhat anecdotal, but I know that you and the
24 rest of the staff traveled all over the state.
25 What were we hearing? What was the

1 preponderance of comments? Were these rural
2 areas wanting to stay with themselves without
3 an urban core? Was the urban core saying,
4 "Leave us to our own devices, the rural folks
5 don't get it," or were they saying, "No, no, we
6 need a blend of rural and urban"? And I
7 realize it is anecdotal and strictly based on
8 the people that came to the meetings, but was
9 there a preponderance in any specific
10 direction?

11 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Mr. Kelly, you are
12 recognized.

13 MR. KELLY: Thank you, Madam Chair.

14 Yes, Representative, predominantly persons
15 from these counties did note wanting to keep
16 their county whole. There may have been an
17 exception, but generally these counties wanted
18 to be kept whole. Persons from counties like
19 Baker County noted a tie-in to the Jacksonville
20 area, but not necessarily wanted to be tied
21 into downtown Jacksonville. So they noted that
22 it is important for them to be grouped with
23 districts that are on that eastern side of the
24 state, but not necessarily with the more urban
25 districts.

1 There was not a lot of commentary about
2 the role of Gainesville and Alachua County in
3 terms of whether or not to be tied to that.
4 Again, most of the sentiment was more along the
5 lines of just being kept whole and having one
6 Senator or one Representative or whomever to be
7 able to visit and work with on issues.

8 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Follow-up?

9 Go ahead, Mr. Kelly.

10 MR. KELLY: Thank you, Madam Chair.

11 In northeast Florida, one of the major
12 points, and a significant point both
13 substantively and from the technical side of
14 map drawing, is the relationship between Nassau
15 and Duval Counties, because there -- it is the
16 corner of the state, obviously you can't go
17 east or north of that point, and so how you
18 treat these counties is an early decision you
19 make in map drawing and probably a key decision
20 to bring forward to you in that you can,
21 generally speaking, as the public offered,
22 either align Nassau County with other rural
23 counties, and so we refer to that as a regional
24 approach, so tying Nassau into communities like
25 Baker County, Union County, Bradford, or the

1 next suggestion was a more local approach.
2 Nassau and Duval Counties happen to be about
3 the size of two Senate districts, and so more
4 than one map drawer, in this case the map
5 drawer who submitted the seventh map, suggested
6 that Nassau and Duval just be split into two
7 districts. And so it is a dynamically
8 different decision, though, in terms of how you
9 are going to -- how you're going to work with
10 the rest of the map.

11 Moving on to more north central Florida,
12 but south of Gainesville, there were a number
13 of comments at the various public meetings and
14 since then regarding the relationship between
15 Marion, Lake and Sumter Counties, and the
16 points made at the meetings had to do more with
17 the community -- about The Villages community
18 and also Marion County essentially to be kept
19 whole. But the decisions with Marion County
20 and Lake County are also quite significant to
21 how really much of even central Florida
22 unravels. So while there are some substantive
23 points, there's a much larger, bigger picture
24 point with Marion County and Lake and The
25 Villages area, because it is in the middle of

1 the map, and so if you opt to keep this
2 community whole, you are locking yourself
3 towards building districts to the east and west
4 of it; if you break this community apart, it
5 has other -- it has other repercussions. So
6 how you deal with this, how you deal with the
7 request to keep Marion County whole, how you
8 deal with the request to keep The Villages
9 together, actually has a significant impact on
10 the entire region, because it is essentially in
11 the middle of the region.

12 The example here in front of you that was
13 submitted, this map drawer -- I don't know that
14 this map drawer actually new much about The
15 Villages *per se*. This map drawer submitted
16 very much compact districts, almost in a
17 block-by-block fashion, without regard to
18 county or city lines; in this case, happened to
19 wrap in the Sumter County side, Lake County
20 side and Marion County sides of The Villages.
21 So effectively it still provides an example of
22 what the request was.

23 The next submission and the next example
24 to take a look at takes in most of The
25 Villages, it takes in the Sumter and Lake

1 County sides, albeit it does not take in the
2 Marion County side, at least Marion County unto
3 itself. Marion County just has a small portion
4 of The Villages. The one thing that is of
5 substance about this is that running the
6 district to the coast then immediately does
7 impact the prior decisions that we just
8 discussed, how you deal with the rural
9 counties, whether you have to align those rural
10 counties with the larger municipalities, so it
11 is a good example of how these decisions start
12 to collide and start to impact each other.

13 And then, in this particular case, we just
14 drew, essentially, if you were going to try to
15 compromise between the notion of keeping Marion
16 County whole and also keeping The Villages
17 whole, this essentially is an example of
18 keeping most of Marion whole, minus The
19 Villages, and then otherwise keeping Lake,
20 Sumter and The Villages whole, and in this
21 particular case, it is a request that in terms
22 of the spirit of the request, you can actually
23 accommodate both requests. But in both cases,
24 both of these districts would need more
25 population.

1 So in terms of looking at the minority
2 access district that is in northeast Florida,
3 coming back to the phrases of "local" and
4 "regional," and we are now on page 15 in your
5 packet, this is an example submitted by a
6 northeast Florida resident who suggested to
7 take the district that currently runs from
8 Duval County all the way down to Volusia
9 County, to take it almost exclusively into
10 Duval County. Now, this particular map drawer
11 has a little leg to the district that goes into
12 Baker, but this map drawer got his population
13 numbers down to a zero deviation for every
14 district, so presumably that is why the
15 district has the little leg to it. But,
16 otherwise, the district is almost entirely in
17 Duval County. It does reduce the voting age
18 population of the African-American community
19 from approximately 46 percent to 41 percent.

20 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Can we proceed?
21 Life will go on. All right. Proceed, Mr.
22 Kelly.

23 MR. KELLY: Thank you, Madam Chair.

24 So there is a substantive point to be made
25 there that it does reduce the African-American

1 voting age population by five percent in the
2 district; however, it is trying to take
3 advantage of that happenstance that Nassau and
4 Duval Counties happen to equal approximately
5 two districts.

6 And then there were two other approaches,
7 one of which was just submitted to us the other
8 day. This district, which is on page 16 in the
9 packet, attempts to recreate the
10 African-American access seat, running this seat
11 from Duval County over to Columbia and also
12 down to Gainesville. Now, this individual
13 maintained the black voting age population of
14 46 percent in the district, and then the next
15 alternative, which was also recently submitted,
16 attempts to maintain that percentage, and,
17 actually, it failed to do so. This actually
18 reduced the African-American voting age
19 population to under 40 percent, about 39 and a
20 half percent. It is slightly different than
21 the current district. The current district
22 goes into Volusia County. This district stops
23 at the Flagler/Volusia line, so it doesn't go
24 into Volusia anymore.

25 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Mr. Kelly, can I

1 stop you? Representative Caldwell.

2 REPRESENTATIVE CALDWELL: Thank you, Madam
3 Chair.

4 Alex, could you back up one map? And this
5 map kind of got me -- wanted to touch here on
6 something I have been thinking about since our
7 last meeting. In the metrics, we kind of
8 reviewed -- as you know, Mr. Kelly talked about
9 there's 11 counties that have to be split by
10 population, and we just discussed this 12th
11 county because of the geography, and in the
12 current maps, we split 45, and I have been
13 trying to think of what is a tangible result
14 that we can give the voters and show them that
15 we have worked on these maps and tried to
16 actually accomplish what we at least perceive
17 to be their intent. And I think when we look
18 at these, we ought to really be considering can
19 we move the ball closer in the natural
20 direction, in other words, less than 45 splits
21 and closer to the 11, even if we can't quite
22 get there. I think that would be an excellent
23 metric as we look at these maps and think about
24 that.

25 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Thank you.

1 Representative, do you have a comment? No
2 comment. All right. Anything further? All
3 right. Anyone else have a question or comment
4 at this point?

5 Mr. Kelly, proceed, please.

6 MR. KELLY: Thank you, Madam Chair.

7 And so moving to page 18 in your books,
8 this slide just simply shows the
9 African-American voting -- or I should say VTDs
10 in north and northeast Florida with an
11 African-American voting age population of
12 35 percent or greater. So in thinking about
13 the prior couple -- prior three public
14 submissions, attempts to recreate that seat,
15 essentially those seats are attempting to reach
16 out to communities in these areas; of course,
17 the one stayed entirely in Duval County.

18 And the next page is like you looked at
19 before in northwest Florida, just for your
20 reference. These are the five largest counties
21 in northwest Florida -- I'm sorry, northeast
22 and north central Florida. And the one visual
23 that comes up here is that in terms of
24 accommodating equal population, again, how you
25 treat the rural districts, whether or not you

1 go into those population centers, it
2 essentially cuts this region in half. And when
3 you think about the submission earlier that
4 essentially created a large, purely rural
5 Senate district, it essentially walked around
6 these counties to create that Senate district.

7 I am moving into central Florida. This is
8 the current Senate map for central Florida, and
9 of note in this area in Orlando, there is a
10 performing African-American district.

11 Regarding the various sort of either/or
12 scenarios of public submissions for this
13 region, a major point that came up both in
14 Orlando and in Brevard County was the notion
15 of, A, giving Brevard County its own entire
16 Senate seat, but then B, also not connecting
17 Brevard to Orange County. And likewise,
18 actually, that suggestion came up from both
19 Brevard County residents and Orange County
20 residents. In this particular case, Brevard
21 would be getting an entire Senate seat unto its
22 own, and it is, for the most part, although
23 there is a little bit of crossover, for the
24 most part, it is disconnected from Orange
25 County.

1 And this is just an example of the
2 opposite. In this case, an Orange County
3 district that was submitted, again, recently
4 that grabs the Titusville community and some of
5 the beach communities and ties them together.

6 In looking at Orlando and Orange County,
7 there were some interesting and different
8 approaches as to how to draw districts for the
9 county. In this particular case, the
10 individual actually very much adhered to city
11 boundary lines. Pretty much nobody adhered to
12 the city boundary lines of the City of Orlando
13 itself, its city boundary lines are rather
14 awkwardly shaped, but in terms of the other
15 cities in Orange County, in Seminole County,
16 this submission here very much walks around
17 those city boundary lines, which in some cases
18 they are very, very close to each other, but up
19 next to each other, so it is a very difficult
20 task to do so, but that is what the map drawer
21 accomplished here was using those city boundary
22 lines, and in effect doing so separating some
23 of the population centers.

24 This particular map drawer, which is the
25 24th page in the packet, this particular map

1 drawer took an approach that appeared a couple
2 of times, which is to separate downtown Orlando
3 from the west side of the county, east side of
4 the county, and then grouping just a little bit
5 of the county, the northern part of the county,
6 with Seminole. Seminole County plus about
7 40,000 residents, give or take, equates to a
8 Senate district. And so that suggestion came
9 up more than one time, but, again, a western,
10 eastern, northern and downtown division. And I
11 will note, though, that this submission did not
12 accomplish the purpose of recreating some form
13 of the African-American seat in Orange County.

14 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Mr. Kelly, could
15 you stop? Representative Cruz, do you have a
16 question?

17 REPRESENTATIVE CRUZ: Thank you, Madam
18 Chair.

19 I just want to mention and ask a question
20 if I am missing something here, but you are
21 speaking of terms in counties, and I am looking
22 at these maps and I am having a really hard
23 time following you, because I don't see
24 anything that designates counties. I see what
25 designates districts with colors, and I can --

1 underneath the overlay of colors, I can see
2 cities, but I don't see anything that tells me
3 counties. So if I am not really familiar with
4 the counties, I am having a hard time here.
5 What am I doing wrong?

6 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Go ahead, Mr.
7 Kelly.

8 MR. KELLY: Thank you, Madam Chair.

9 I apologize, it is probably just difficult
10 to see with all of the layers of information
11 there. In this particular case, with this
12 slide, we highlighted -- we highlighted the
13 boundaries of Orange County to help out, but
14 you are right, some of the slides are more
15 difficult to see. For the future, what we can
16 do is we can label the counties more
17 specifically, if that helps.

18 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: That's good.

19 REPRESENTATIVE CRUZ: Thank you.

20 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Representative
21 Cruz, is that good?

22 REPRESENTATIVE CRUZ: That is good.

23 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Thank you.

24 Proceed, Mr. Kelly. Oh, you have another
25 question, Representative Boyd, and then

1 Representative -- I'm sorry, just

2 Representative Boyd. Go ahead.

3 REPRESENTATIVE BOYD: Pardon me. Thank
4 you, Madam Chair, and I guess following up on
5 Representative Cruz' remark and then I think
6 Representative Caldwell touched on it and,
7 Alex, you might have just touched on it with
8 the city boundaries. I understand the idea
9 there of trying to keep things geographically
10 kind of concise, but county, city, whatever,
11 but I don't want us to lose the importance or
12 relevance of boundary -- other boundary lines
13 that might be important, roadways, rivers,
14 waterways, those types of things as well. So I
15 understand the reason to split, but I hope we
16 are taking into consideration some of those
17 other, you know, if you will, geographical
18 boundaries as well as we look at these.

19 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Thank you,
20 excellent comment. Thank you.

21 All right. Yes, Representative Workman.

22 REPRESENTATIVE WORKMAN: Thank you. I
23 don't mean to make this a debate, but I was
24 really excited about the comment that Caldwell
25 made. I don't mean to debate you,

1 Representative Boyd, but, you know, we're going
2 to use all those things, roadways, county
3 lines, all that stuff, and if we can't set a
4 goal as a committee that we are going to do
5 better than that, which is what, like 45 now,
6 we split 45 counties, if we can't do better
7 than that, I think we are going to shortchange
8 ourselves. I think we should look at making
9 that almost a policy, Chairman, that we look to
10 cut counties more than we have now, fewer
11 counties now than we do. So fewer than 45 I
12 think should be a minimum goal here.

13 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Well, you know,
14 Representative Workman, that is good, it goes
15 back to Rep Caldwell's also comment, which was
16 an excellent comment, and we heard from the
17 public, too.

18 Did you want to comment on that, Rep Boyd?

19 REPRESENTATIVE BOYD: No -- thank you,
20 Madam Chair. No, I wouldn't debate, I was just
21 looking at the big picture. That was just my
22 only consideration.

23 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: All right. On the
24 same comment, Representative Kiar? No
25 comments?

1 REPRESENTATIVE KIAR: I was going to ask
2 why --

3 A VOICE: I told him not to.

4 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Look at this face.

5 All right, members, proceeding. All
6 right. Any other comments on that issue?

7 All right. There being none, would you
8 proceed, Mr. Kelly?

9 MR. KELLY: Thank you, Madam Chair.

10 The next item in your packet is --
11 actually, about three or four recent
12 suggestions have all proposed something similar
13 to this, which is creating a Hispanic access
14 seat in the Orange and Osceola County area, and
15 actually, this seat also extends cross
16 basically the Poinciana community into Osceola
17 County -- sorry, into Polk County as well, and
18 so it is a three-county Hispanic access seat.
19 The voting age population of the seat would be
20 approximately 48 percent, and it is similar in
21 geography to -- if you recall from the Orlando
22 public meeting where a proposed congressional
23 district -- a Hispanic access seat was
24 submitted as well, so it is a similar geography
25 to that.

1 And then in this particular case, the next
2 suggestion, just as an example of maintaining
3 the existing minority representation in Orange
4 County, this submission is just a recreation
5 of -- or a similar district to the existing
6 African-American seat in Orange County. The
7 seat has a -- almost a 34 percent black voting
8 age population, although it also has almost a
9 36 percent Hispanic voting age population as
10 well. So if you think about this -- this idea
11 compared to the prior, they do cross over in
12 terms of some of the geography.

13 And just looking at -- the next two slides
14 look at the major concentrations of the
15 African-American community and of the Hispanic
16 community in that central Florida area, and,
17 again, you can -- when you look at the slides,
18 you can kind of get a sense of how those
19 individuals probably drew those districts.
20 And, in fact, looking at this particular slide,
21 the major concentration of the Hispanic
22 community in Orange, Osceola and Polk almost
23 follows -- near follows the exact boundary
24 lines of that district that was submitted, and,
25 again, just for your reference, as far as

1 central Florida goes, the larger counties in
2 the region, which is most of the region, it is
3 a fast-growing region of the state.

4 So moving into southeast Florida, this is
5 the current map -- it doesn't go all the way
6 down to the Keys, but this is the current map
7 for most of the region. There are two
8 African-American majority districts in
9 southeast Florida, there are three Hispanic
10 districts that are in southeast Florida, and so
11 those issues tend to be of a greater scale in
12 southeast Florida because it tends to
13 dramatically affect the drawing of all the
14 districts in southeast Florida.

15 In terms of the different options that
16 came forward, coming back to that phrase,
17 "anchoring," this is an example right here in
18 terms of Palm Beach, Broward and Dade in terms
19 of the map drawer didn't necessarily always
20 abide by county lines and city lines, but what
21 they did do was they did essentially appear to
22 assure that each county had a certain committed
23 number of majority seats, a majority -- I say
24 majority, the majority of the seat's geography
25 and population is in one county or the other.

1 And that was in terms of the -- particularly
2 the meetings in Palm Beach, the meetings in
3 Broward and Miami, that was a particular
4 concept that came up frequently reflecting back
5 on the Palm Beach County Commission when they
6 testified -- made the point that they were okay
7 with a district perhaps going into Martin
8 County, but what they wanted to be assured of
9 was that at least three Senate seats, or a
10 majority in Palm Beach County. And, again,
11 there was similar sentiment for Broward and
12 Miami-Dade.

13 The alternative -- one of the alternatives
14 to that that was brought forward a number of
15 times is drawing more coastal-based districts
16 in southeast Florida, and this is an example of
17 that. Neither one of these examples unto
18 themselves, because of them, causes any
19 particular harm to the African-American or
20 Hispanic districts that are in southeast
21 Florida. So by virtue of adopting one of these
22 or looking at both of them, neither of them
23 just has an automatic effect in that manner.

24 Moving to the next slide, submission
25 number 86, which is on page 35 in your packet,

1 in this particular case, the map drawer drew
2 very square districts, and where they are not
3 squared, frequently used roadways as a way to
4 create an edge to the district, but very
5 frequently used square districts. This
6 particular submission did have some impact on
7 the African-American seats in this part of the
8 state. No real substantial impact on the
9 Hispanic seats, but it did impact the
10 African-American seats in the part of the
11 state. So in terms of weighing those options,
12 and it may have just been this map drawer's
13 submission, but this was the one of the three
14 that noticeably an effect on minority
15 representation in southeast Florida.

16 Moving on to the next couple of slides,
17 which are both on page 37 in your packet, these
18 show an example of creating and recreating --
19 in this case, recreating an African-American
20 majority seat in Palm Beach and Broward
21 Counties. This is similar to the existing
22 district today.

23 In the next slide, the individual, which
24 is the 56th submission we received, the next
25 slide shows an African-American majority seat

1 solely in Broward County. And a consideration
2 to make in terms of if you were going to adopt
3 a seat like that is the African-American
4 communities in Riviera Beach in Palm Beach
5 County would have a contention that they have
6 been removed from a seat where they could elect
7 a candidate of choice. And so when you go
8 through decisions like this, you are not only
9 thinking about retaining a seat -- in this
10 case, this does retain an African-American
11 seat, but you are thinking about the community
12 that is no longer in the seat and whether or
13 not you would want to make sure that maybe they
14 are meaningfully put all together in one seat,
15 or you would just want to make sure that you
16 walk through very carefully how you put that
17 community in a different district.

18 Moving on to the next -- the next item
19 dealing with Miami-Dade and Monroe Counties,
20 this particular submission maintained the
21 African-American access seat that comes out of
22 Miami-Dade and Monroe Counties, albeit very
23 different looking than the existing Senate
24 District 39 today. The seat today is actually
25 a Hispanic plurality. It is about 29 percent

1 African-American, 45 percent Hispanic; however,
2 it has performed for African-Americans. In
3 this particular case, what the map drawer did
4 was actually make the seat significantly more
5 African-American, took it up to almost
6 45 percent. However, what they did was they
7 did so at the expense of a district, again,
8 that looks very similar to the current Senate
9 District 29. They brought that seat below the
10 majority-minority status, so there was a
11 consequence to their effort to try to make this
12 seat more African-American.

13 In this particular case, in map 72, the
14 map drawer drew a fourth Hispanic majority seat
15 in south Florida, which appeared in several
16 different suggestions that were submitted by
17 the public. This particular one, it is in all
18 likelihood that the actual population is high
19 enough that it would truly be a Hispanic
20 majority seat. In terms of whether you would
21 make a decision to create a fourth Hispanic
22 seat, you have to be very careful that the
23 actual number of citizens and registered voters
24 who are Hispanic is actually high enough to
25 make it an effective minority district;

1 otherwise, it could appear to have -- it could
2 appear to be, but not actually turn out to be,
3 and that is an important consideration under
4 Section 2 of the Voting Rights Act and just in
5 terms of how you create these districts. Now,
6 that said, this seat does eliminate that
7 African-American access seat, so there was a
8 trade-off for this map drawer and several
9 others who submitted a very similar -- very
10 similar item.

11 Just coming back to the southeast -- the
12 three major southeast Florida counties, Palm
13 Beach, Broward and Dade, the next few slides --
14 in this case, this is -- it doesn't say on the
15 slide, but this is the African-American voting
16 age population concentrations in Palm Beach
17 County. In Broward County, where before you
18 saw that majority-minority seat submitted in
19 Broward County, that seat pretty much tracked
20 the boundaries of these VTDs. This is
21 Miami-Dade County, African-American.

22 And then a thing to note, and we will
23 bounce back and forth between a couple of
24 slides here, is in looking at Palm Beach
25 County, this is the Hispanic community of Palm

1 Beach County. If you go back just a few pages,
2 you will note the close proximity of the
3 African-American and Hispanic communities in
4 Palm Beach County. Again, an issue you have to
5 deal with in Palm Beach and Miami-Dade, in
6 Orlando, the examples that we looked at earlier
7 of attempting to create or recreate an access
8 or majority-minority seat, but yet you could
9 potentially intermix the two -- intermix
10 African-American and Hispanic, and so there
11 could be an expense to creating one seat at the
12 cost of the other. So just something to think
13 about. And this is the Hispanic community in
14 Broward County and Miami-Dade as well.

15 Now, in terms of why we covered Palm
16 Beach, Broward and Miami-Dade and didn't get so
17 much into Martin and St. Lucie, the reality of
18 drawing seats in southeast Florida is that
19 those three counties are going to drive most of
20 the decisions, because it is where most of the
21 population is. And so oftentimes you see, in
22 maps that are submitted, very frequently you
23 see at least one Senate district that runs from
24 the top edge of Palm Beach County into Martin,
25 because oftentimes the map drawer is focusing

1 on the areas of biggest population, complying
2 with the Voting Rights Act, and also, for
3 practical purposes, oftentimes you start at
4 Monroe and work your way into Miami-Dade.

5 And for southwest Florida, there is a
6 little bit of overlap between southeast and
7 southwest because of the existing Senate
8 District 39 and some of the communities that
9 are affected by the Voting Rights Act, but this
10 is the current map for southwest Florida, and
11 there is in Tampa an African-American access
12 seat that runs from -- runs -- I should say
13 runs from Hillsborough County into Pinellas,
14 down into Manatee, and then there's also the
15 African-American access seat that comes over
16 into Collier County from the Keys and from
17 Miami-Dade. So there are a couple of
18 considerations for this region of the state
19 regarding minority access.

20 In terms of the different kinds of
21 suggestions and sort of -- again, sort of
22 either/or type scenarios for the southwest
23 region, there were three general kind of looks
24 that were given in terms of Hillsborough all
25 the way down into Lee County, excluding Collier

1 from this point. In this particular case, this
2 is taking a look at Pinellas and Hillsborough
3 Counties. The map drawer effectively put two
4 districts almost entirely in Pinellas, although
5 not completely, one seat does cross over into
6 Hillsborough. The map drawer did put two seats
7 entirely in Hillsborough County, the one that
8 is right there along the waterfront that has
9 the bridges, and then the seat that is shaded
10 in white. The seat that is shaded in more of a
11 pinkish red color, that seat actually is about
12 half in Manatee County, so that seat actually
13 is probably about 50/50 Hillsborough and
14 Manatee. But, anyway, the crux of this
15 submission was this person gave basically each
16 county two dedicated voices in the State
17 Senate.

18 Here is another example of a similar
19 concept where the map drawer, actually the City
20 of Bonita Springs, submitted this map that
21 included almost all of Lee County, excluding
22 Cape Coral. Lee County happens to be about the
23 size of four State House districts, so -- very,
24 very near to it, so -- and Cape Coral happens
25 to be about the size of a House district, so

1 the map drawer effectively took -- if you were
2 drawing a House map, the map drawer effectively
3 took one district, put it into -- or one part
4 of the county, I should say, and put it into
5 another -- another district. And so -- and
6 this would be giving Lee County its own voice
7 in the State Senate.

8 This map drawer took a big chunk of the
9 rural counties, or rural communities in
10 southwest Florida, putting them all into one
11 district, and this is on page 46 in your
12 packet. In this particular case, all the
13 communities that are to the west of the rural
14 district equates to about two and a half Senate
15 seats. So you would have to then allot those
16 communities into about two and a half coastal
17 Senate districts. And this individual, in
18 terms of coming back to the point of using
19 different geographical boundary lines, this
20 person leaned heavily on Interstate 75 as a way
21 to divide the communities.

22 In this particular suggestion, what was
23 interesting -- and this particular map
24 drawer -- and this is on page 47 in your
25 packet. This particular map drawer separated

1 rural from coastal counties, and did so via
2 county lines, but then within those districts
3 did not adhere to county lines. So it was
4 interesting to see how this map drawer used the
5 counties as their way to say the county is
6 either rural or coastal, but then within those
7 communities crossed county lines and used other
8 boundaries for their purposes. And what you
9 find oftentimes in looking at Collier and Lee
10 Counties is the usage too in terms of the
11 waterways as a way to divide the different
12 districts, and that appears in a number of the
13 submissions.

14 And coming back up to Tampa Bay, in terms
15 of the minority access district, this was one
16 of the closest submissions that came close to
17 the current African-American voting age
18 population for the district in -- again, in
19 Hillsborough, Pinellas and Manatee County.
20 This district has about a 35 percent
21 African-American voting age population. I
22 believe the current district is around
23 37 percent. The one challenge that you have
24 with Pinellas County is that Pinellas County's
25 population actually declined. So in terms of

1 maintaining a district like this -- and this
2 district does fall under the jurisdiction of
3 Section 5 of the Voting Rights Act because of
4 its Hillsborough County affiliation -- in terms
5 of maintaining a district like this, those
6 population issues can be a real challenge and
7 can require a lot of effort for this single
8 district.

9 And then in terms of Collier County, this
10 was the submission you just saw for southeast
11 Florida, same information, but, again, this
12 particular person took the Hispanic communities
13 from Miami-Dade over into Hendry and Collier to
14 create a Hispanic majority seat. There were a
15 number of public comments from Collier County
16 residents about preferring to be represented by
17 a Hispanic Senator as opposed to an
18 African-American Senator, and this person -- I
19 don't know if that was their intent, but this
20 person created a seat that created that effect.

21 And just like the other regions, the next
22 couple of graphics just show you the
23 concentrations of the African-American and
24 Hispanic communities in parts of southwest
25 Florida, in this case, Hillsborough, Pinellas

1 and Manatee Counties, and actually, I think
2 even the bottom of that actually maybe even
3 gets into Sarasota. I am not sure if it cuts
4 it off or not, but -- and then in this
5 particular case, the Hispanic communities in
6 Collier and Hendry Counties, both counties
7 covered under Section 5 of the Voting Rights
8 Act. And southwest Florida's major population
9 centers in terms of its largest counties are a
10 little more spread out than some of the other
11 counties when you compare this region to
12 central Florida or compared to -- or compared
13 to southeast Florida. So in terms of drawing
14 districts, completing districts, your middle
15 rural communities, oftentimes if you look at
16 what the map drawers have submitted, they
17 oftentimes are reaching out to pieces of the
18 more urban areas to complete their district.
19 Oftentimes the more rural county districts that
20 were presented for this region, they would
21 reach out and grab a piece of the rural parts
22 of Hillsborough County or a significant chunk
23 of let's say Charlotte County to complete and
24 get enough population.

25 And with that, Madam Chair, that is the

1 presentation.

2 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Thank you very
3 much, Mr. Kelly. Excellent presentation.

4 All right. Members, do we have any
5 questions? Comments? Come on. Representative
6 Jenne, I know you are holding something back.

7 REPRESENTATIVE JENNE: I mean, if you want
8 me to, I can.

9 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: No, it is up to
10 you, if you would like to comment.

11 REPRESENTATIVE JENNE: No, ma'am, you
12 always are wonderful with that. No thank you.

13 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Okay.
14 Representative Rouson.

15 REPRESENTATIVE ROUSON: Yes, Madam Chair.

16 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Please go ahead.

17 REPRESENTATIVE ROUSON: My comment is you
18 have run a good meeting.

19 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: All right,
20 members, gosh, I know, there must be something
21 going on that people want to get out, but that
22 is good, I really appreciate that. Yes,
23 Representative Kiar.

24 REPRESENTATIVE KIAR: I apologize, Madam
25 Chair.

1 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Go ahead.

2 REPRESENTATIVE KIAR: I know we were just
3 about to end.

4 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Absolutely.

5 REPRESENTATIVE KIAR: Actually, I don't
6 have a comment, but I did -- there was one part
7 that I apologize I missed, and I was just
8 wondering if you could go back to it real fast,
9 if that is okay.

10 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Sure, what was
11 that?

12 REPRESENTATIVE KIAR: It was just the --
13 on page 35, you were going through the map and
14 you were giving a little presentation on it,
15 and I just was wondering if you could just
16 quickly give a synopsis of that one more time.
17 I apologize, I was taking notes on every one.

18 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Page 35, is that
19 it?

20 REPRESENTATIVE KIAR: Page 35.

21 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: All right. We
22 will wait for Mr. Kelly to direct his attention
23 to that and then recognize him. Go ahead,
24 please.

25 MR. KELLY: Thank you, Madam Chair.

1 The -- what we were looking at were
2 different ways that southeastern Florida,
3 Miami-Dade, Palm Beach, Broward County
4 districts, are divided amongst the different
5 maps, and there were three general ways that
6 they were divided. Some individuals submitted
7 coastal districts. Some individuals submitted
8 districts that showed an intent to have the
9 majority, if not a whole seat, in a county to
10 give that county a dedicated voice in the
11 Legislature. But other individuals submitted
12 what I would refer to as more squared
13 districts. And just in terms of looking at
14 these submissions, the square district
15 submission, or one observation is that it did
16 affect the African-American districts. It may
17 have just been the submission, I don't know
18 that that is an entire pattern, but it was the
19 only of the three types that did have a clear
20 effect on any of the minority districts in
21 south Florida.

22 Now, it is very possible that if you
23 connect back to the Broward County submission
24 of a majority -- oh, there was -- in effect, it
25 was in Broward County -- a majority-minority

1 seat in Broward County, that district was
2 relatively square, too. So it may have just
3 been where the lines were picked for this
4 submission, but, again, it was the only one
5 that affected those communities.

6 REPRESENTATIVE HUKILL: Anything else?
7 Okay, that is fine. Members, this is the time
8 to ask questions, comments, we have him here.

9 Okay, members, there being no further
10 comments or questions, I want to thank you for
11 your participation, it is extremely important.

12 Next meeting we are going to have a
13 presentation on redistricting data, and that is
14 a precursor to the kind of data that we will be
15 presented with when we hear PCBs and/or member
16 bills, so we will have some good information on
17 that.

18 And if there are no further comments,
19 questions or anything else, with that,
20 Representative Horner moves we rise. Thank
21 you.

22 (Whereupon, the proceedings were
23 concluded.)

24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF FLORIDA)
COUNTY OF LEON)

I hereby certify that the foregoing transcript is of a tape-recording taken down by the undersigned, and the contents thereof were reduced to typewriting under my direction;

That the foregoing pages 2 through 48 represent a true, correct, and complete transcript of the tape-recording;

And I further certify that I am not of kin or counsel to the parties in the case; am not in the regular employ of counsel for any of said parties; nor am I in anywise interested in the result of said case.

Dated this 20th day of February, 2012.

CLARA C. ROTRUCK

Notary Public

State of Florida at Large

Commission Expires:

November 13, 2014