Florida Senate - 1999

By Senator Geller

29-1197-99 A bill to be entitled 1 2 An act relating to insurance; providing an insurance compliance self-evaluation privilege 3 4 for insurers and persons conducting activities regulated under the Florida Insurance Code who 5 conduct voluntary internal audits of their 6 7 compliance programs and management systems to improve compliance with state and federal law; 8 9 providing that such audit documents are 10 privileged and not discoverable or admissible 11 as evidence in any civil, criminal, or 12 administrative proceeding; providing conditions; providing for inapplicability of 13 the privilege under certain circumstances; 14 authorizing the court to require disclosure 15 16 upon making a determination that the assertion of the privilege is fraudulent or that the 17 material is not subject to the privilege; 18 19 prescribing documents to which the privilege 20 does not apply; providing definitions; 21 providing an effective date. 22 23 Be It Enacted by the Legislature of the State of Florida: 24 25 Section 1. Insurance compliance self-evaluation 26 privilege.--27 (1)(a) To encourage insurance companies and persons 28 conducting activities regulated under the Florida Insurance 29 Code to conduct voluntary internal audits of their compliance 30 programs and management systems and to assess and improve compliance with state and federal laws, an insurance 31 1

1

2 3

4 5

б

7

8

compliance self-evaluation privilege is recognized to protect the confidentiality of communications relating to voluntary internal compliance audits. The Legislature finds that protection of insurance consumers is enhanced by companies' voluntary compliance with this state's insurance laws and other laws and that the public will benefit from incentives to identify and remedy insurance and other compliance problems. The Legislature further finds that limited expansion of the protection against disclosure will encourage voluntary compliance and improve insurance market conduct quality. (b)1. Except as provided in paragraphs (c) and (d), an insurance compliance self-evaluation audit document is

9 protection against disclosure will encourage voluntary compliance and improve insurance market conduct quality. 10 11 (b)1. Except as provided in paragraphs (c) and (d), an insurance compliance self-evaluation audit document is 12 privileged and is not discoverable or admissible as evidence 13 in any civil, criminal, or administrative proceeding. This 14 privilege is a matter of substantive law and is not merely a 15 procedural matter governing civil or criminal procedures. 16 2. If any company, person, or entity performs or 17 directs the performance of an insurance compliance audit, an 18 19 officer, employee, or agent involved with the insurance compliance audit or any consultant who is hired for the 20 21 purpose of performing the insurance compliance audit may not be examined in any civil, criminal, or administrative 22 proceeding as to the insurance compliance audit or any 23 24 insurance compliance self-evaluation audit document. This 25 subparagraph does not apply if the privilege provided in subparagraph 1. is determined under paragraph (c) or paragraph 26 27 (d) to be inapplicable. 28 3. Except as provided in paragraph (d): 29 Voluntary disclosure of an insurance compliance a. 30 self-evaluation audit document to the Insurance Commissioner, the Department of Legal Affairs, or any state attorney does 31

2

1 not constitute a waiver of the privilege set forth in 2 subparagraph 1. 3 b. Any compliance self-evaluation audit document voluntarily disclosed to the Insurance Commissioner, the 4 5 Department of Legal Affairs, or any state attorney remains the property of the company and is not subject to disclosure under б 7 chapter 119, Florida Statutes. 8 (c)1. The privilege set forth in paragraph (b) does 9 not apply to the extent that it is expressly waived by the 10 company that prepared or caused to be prepared the insurance 11 compliance self-evaluation audit document. 2. In a civil proceeding, a court of record may, after 12 an in-camera review, require disclosure of material for which 13 the privilege set forth in paragraph (b) is asserted, if the 14 court determines that: 15 The privilege is asserted for a fraudulent purpose; 16 a. 17 or 18 The material is not subject to the privilege. b. 19 (d) The privilege set forth in paragraph (b) does not 20 apply in any criminal or administrative proceeding initiated 21 by the Insurance Commissioner, the Department of Legal Affairs, or any state attorney, upon the filing of formal 22 administrative or criminal charges against the company. Any 23 24 compliance self-evaluation audit document produced to the 25 Insurance Commissioner, the Department of Legal Affairs, or any state attorney under this paragraph or otherwise in the 26 27 possession of the Insurance Commissioner, the Department of 28 Legal Affairs, or any state attorney at the time formal 29 administrative or criminal charges are filed against the 30 company is subject to disclosure under chapter 119, Florida 31 Statutes.

1	(e)1. A company asserting the insurance compliance
2	self-evaluation privilege set forth in paragraph (b) has the
3	burden of demonstrating the applicability of the privilege.
4	Once a company has established the applicability of the
5	privilege, the party seeking disclosure under sub-subparagraph
6	(c)2.a. has the burden of proving that the privilege is
7	asserted for a fraudulent purpose.
8	2. The parties may stipulate in proceedings under
9	paragraph (c) or paragraph (d) to whether the entry of an
10	order directing that specific information contained in an
11	insurance compliance self-evaluation audit document is subject
12	to the privilege provided under paragraph (b). Any such
13	stipulation may be limited to the instant proceeding and,
14	absent specific language to the contrary, does not apply to
15	any other proceeding.
16	(f) The privilege set forth in paragraph (b) does not
17	extend to:
18	1. Documents, communications, data, reports, or other
19	information expressly required to be collected, developed,
20	maintained, or reported to a regulatory agency under the
21	Florida Insurance Code or other federal or state law;
22	2. Information obtained by any regulatory agency
23	through observation or monitoring; or
24	3. Information obtained from a source independent of
25	the insurance compliance audit.
26	(g) As used in this section, the term:
27	1. "Insurance compliance audit" means a voluntary,
28	internal evaluation, review, assessment, audit, or
29	investigation for the purpose of identifying or preventing
30	noncompliance with or promoting compliance with laws,
31	provisions of this code, rules adopted thereunder, or
	4

1 departmental orders which is conducted by or on behalf of a company in reaction to a specific occurrence, circumstance, or 2 3 activity. "Insurance compliance self-evaluation audit 4 2. 5 document" means a document prepared as a result of or in б connection with an insurance compliance audit. An insurance 7 compliance self-evaluation audit document may include a 8 written response to the findings of an insurance compliance 9 audit. An insurance compliance self-evaluation audit document may include, but is not limited to, field notes and records of 10 11 observations, findings, opinions, suggestions, conclusions, drafts, memoranda, drawings, photographs, exhibits, 12 computer-generated or electronically recorded information, 13 phone records, maps, charts, graphs, and surveys, provided 14 that this supporting information is created for the sole 15 purpose and in the course of an insurance compliance audit. An 16 17 insurance compliance self-evaluation audit document does not 18 include any document prepared before the commencement of an 19 insurance compliance audit. An insurance compliance self-evaluation audit document also includes, but is not 20 21 limited to: a. An insurance compliance audit report prepared by an 22 auditor, who may be an employee of the company or an 23 24 independent contractor, which report may include the audit 25 conclusions and recommendations; Memoranda and documents analyzing portions or all 26 b. 27 of the insurance compliance self-evaluation audit report and 28 discussing potential implementation issues; 29 An implementation plan that addresses correcting с. 30 past noncompliance, improving current compliance, and

31 preventing future noncompliance; or

5

1 d. Analytic data generated in the course of conducting the insurance compliance self-evaluation audit. 2 3 "Company" means an authorized insurer as defined in 3. 4 section 624.09, Florida Statutes. 5 The insurance compliance self-evaluation privilege (h) 6 created by this section applies to all civil proceedings 7 pending on the effective date of this section. 8 (2) Nothing in this section nor the release of any 9 self-evaluation audit document under this section limits, 10 waives, or abrogates the scope or nature of any statutory or 11 common law privilege, including, but not limited to, the work 12 product doctrine, the attorney-client privilege, or the 13 subsequent remedial measures exclusion. 14 Section 2. This act shall take effect July 1, 1999. 15 16 17 SENATE SUMMARY 18 Provides an insurance compliance self-evaluation privilege for insurance compliance serievation regulated under the Florida Insurance Code who conduct voluntary internal audits of their compliance programs and management systems to improve compliance with state and federal law. Provides that such audit documents are 19 20 privileged and not discoverable or admissible as evidence in any civil, criminal, or administrative proceeding. Provides conditions. Provides for inapplicability of the privilege under cortain girages butberized the 21 22 court to require disclosure upon making a determination that the assertion of the privilege is fraudulent or that 23 the material is not subject to the privilege. Provides documents to which the privilege does not apply. Provides 24 25 definitions. 26 27 28 29 30 31 6