Bill No. SJR 124

Amendment No. 1 Barcode 750096

CHAMBER ACTION Senate House 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 The Committee on Criminal Justice recommended the following amendment: 12 13 14 Senate Amendment On page 2, lines 6-26, delete those lines 15 16 17 and insert: 18 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the following statement be 19 placed on the ballot: 20 CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT 21 ARTICLE I, SECTION 17 22 UNITED STATES SUPREME COURT INTERPRETATION OF CRUEL AND 23 UNUSUAL PUNISHMENT. -- Proposing an amendment to the State 24 Constitution identical to a proposed amendment to Section 17 25 of Article I of the State Constitution which was approved by a 26 statewide vote in 1998. The Supreme Court of Florida struck 27 the 1998 amendment in a ruling in which four of the seven justices found that the ballot summary was inaccurate. The 28 29 proposed amendment expressly authorizes the death penalty for 30 capital crimes, and expressly authorizes retroactive changes 31 in the method of execution. The amendment changes the

Bill No. SJR 124 Amendment No. 1 Barcode 750096

prohibition against "cruel or unusual punishment," currently provided in Section 17 of Article I of the State Constitution, to a prohibition against "cruel and unusual punishment" to conform with the wording of the Eighth Amendment to the Federal Constitution. The amendment prohibits reduction of a death sentence based on invalidity of an execution method, and provides for continued force of the sentence. The amendment permits any execution method unless prohibited by the Federal Constitution. The amendment requires construction of the prohibition against cruel or unusual punishment and the proposed prohibition against cruel and unusual punishment to conform to United States Supreme Court interpretation of the Eighth Amendment. The amendment would prevent state courts, including the Florida Supreme Court, from treating the state 14 constitutional prohibition against cruel or unusual punishment as being more expansive than the federal constitutional prohibition against cruel and unusual punishment or United States Supreme Court interpretations thereof. The amendment effectively nullifies rights currently allowed under the state prohibition against cruel or unusual punishment which may afford greater protections for those subject to punishment for crimes than will be provided by the amendment. Under the amendment, the protections afforded those subject to 24 punishment for crimes under the "cruel or unusual punishment" 25 clause, as that clause currently appears in Section 17 of Article I of the State Constitution, will be the same as the 26 27 minimum protections provided under the "cruel and unusual" punishments clause of the Eighth Amendment of the Federal Constitution. The amendment provides for retroactive applicability.

28

29

2

3

4

5

6

7

8 9

10

11 12

13

15 16

17

18

19

20 21

22

23

Bill No. SJR 124 Amendment No. 1 Barcode 750096

Specifically, the proposal amends Section 17 of Article I of State Constitution, to read as set forth below. The word stricken is deleted; words underlined are additions:

3 4 5

6 7

8

9 10

11 12

13

15

17

19

20

21

22 23

24

2

SECTION 17. Excessive punishments. -- Excessive fines, cruel and or unusual punishment, attainder, forfeiture of estate, indefinite imprisonment, and unreasonable detention of witnesses are forbidden. The death penalty is an authorized punishment for capital crimes designated by the Legislature. The prohibition against cruel or unusual punishment, and the prohibition against cruel and unusual punishment, shall be construed in conformity with decisions of the United States Supreme Court which interpret the prohibition against cruel and unusual punishment provided in the Eighth Amendment to the 14 United States Constitution. Any method of execution shall be allowed, unless prohibited by the United States Constitution. 16 Methods of execution may be designated by the Legislature, and a change in any method of execution may be applied 18 retroactively. A sentence of death shall not be reduced on the basis that a method of execution is invalid. In any case in which an execution method is declared invalid, the death sentence shall remain in force until the sentence can be lawfully executed by any valid method. This section shall

25 26

27

28

29 30

31

apply retroactively.