By Senator Wasserman Schultz

32-364A-01

1 A bill to be entitled 2 An act for the relief of the estate of Frank 3 Lee Smith; providing an appropriation to 4 compensate that estate for Mr. Smith's having 5 been the victim of a miscarriage of justice; 6 providing for a waiver of any claims by the 7 estate of Frank Lee Smith; providing an effective date. 8 9 WHEREAS, on April 14, 1985, 8-year-old Shandra 10 Whitehead was the victim of a brutal rape and murder in 11 12 Broward County, Florida, and WHEREAS, on May 9, 1985, Frank Lee Smith was indicted 13 14 for first-degree murder, burglary, and sexual battery in connection with the Shandra Whitehead case, and 15 WHEREAS, Frank Lee Smith maintained his innocence 16 17 during interrogation by sheriff's deputies assigned to the 18 case, and 19 WHEREAS, Frank Lee Smith was tried and convicted on all 20 counts and received a sentence of death on the conviction for 21 first-degree murder, and 22 WHEREAS, there were no fingerprints, hair fibers, 23 blood, semen, or other physical evidence linking Frank Lee Smith to the crime or the crime scene, and 24 25 WHEREAS, Mr. Smith was convicted primarily upon the 26 basis of testimony provided by a witness who stated at trial 27 that she recognized Frank Lee Smith as the person who 28 approached her car on the night of Shandra Whitehead's murder in the vicinity of the victim's residence, and 29 30 WHEREAS, prior to trial, this key state witness

1

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

31 provided the sheriff's detective with a description of the man

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24

25

26

27 28

29

30

she saw in the vicinity of the murder victim's home which did not match Frank Lee Smith's physical appearance, and

WHEREAS, the key state witness subsequently recanted her trial testimony in a 1989 affidavit, stating that she felt pressured by the sheriff's detectives into providing her trial testimony and was certain that Frank Lee Smith was not the person she saw on the night of Shandra Whitehead's murder, and

WHEREAS, Mr. Smith remained incarcerated on Florida's death row for 14 years, including 11 years after the state's key witness recanted her trial testimony, and

WHEREAS, the state prosecutors or local sheriff's detectives, or both, through negligence or design, continued to maintain that Frank Lee Smith was the perpetrator of the murder even after the recantation of the state's key witness, and

WHEREAS, the state prosecutors or local sheriff's office, or both, through negligence or design, failed to investigate evidence implicating another likely suspect as the perpetrator of the crime, and

WHEREAS, the other suspect is a relative of the victim's mother who would have been familiar with the family's routines and would have had opportunity to commit the crime, and

WHEREAS, the other suspect matches the physical description provided to police by the state's key witness before the arrest and trial of Mr. Smith, for example, with respect to his having a distinctive "droopy eye," and

WHEREAS, the other suspect was also under suspicion in a series of other sexual assaults and murders which occurred in Broward County, and Mr. Smith had no criminal history of 31 sexual assaults, and

1 WHEREAS, the other suspect was known to the police at 2 the time of Mr. Smith's arrest in 1985, and 3 WHEREAS, at the time of the recantation by the state's 4 key witness, the other suspect was confined to a state mental 5 institution because he had been found to be incompetent to 6 stand trial for other crimes, and 7 WHEREAS, Mr. Smith died of cancer on January 30, 2000, 8 while in state custody in a facility far from his family and 9 friends, and 10 WHEREAS, Mr. Smith was deprived of having medical care 11 of his own choosing and was without the comfort and support of his family and friends while he suffered through a terminal 12 13 illness, and WHEREAS, Mr. Smith's sister is a registered nurse who 14 15 has experience in hospice care and could have provided both 16 medical and spiritual support to Mr. Smith at the end of his 17 life had Mr. Smith not been wrongfully incarcerated for a crime he did not commit, and 18 19 WHEREAS, DNA evidence was tested by the Federal Bureau of Investigation laboratory, and the FBI report dated December 20 13, 2000, confirms that Frank Lee Smith was not the 21 22 perpetrator of the rape and murder of Shandra Whitehead, and WHEREAS, the trial court has now set aside the 23 24 convictions and sentences of Frank Lee Smith in the Shandra 25 Whitehead case, and WHEREAS, Mr. Smith suffered physical, mental, and 26 emotional harm while incarcerated on death row, and 27 28 WHEREAS, Mr. Smith and his family suffered shame, 29 humiliation, and mortification from being associated with a

heinous crime committed against an innocent child, and

30 31

1 WHEREAS, considering the totality of the circumstances, 2 a gross miscarriage of justice occurred, and agents of the 3 state and local law enforcement officials cooperated in that 4 miscarriage, either negligently or deliberately, NOW, 5 THEREFORE, 6 7 Be It Enacted by the Legislature of the State of Florida: 8 9 Section 1. The sum of \$3.5 million is appropriated 10 from the General Revenue Fund to be paid to the estate of 11 Frank Lee Smith as full and complete compensation for Mr. Smith's having been the victim of a miscarriage of justice. 12 Section 2. Acceptance of payment of this claim by the 13 14 estate of Frank Lee Smith constitutes a waiver of any cause of 15 action that the estate of Mr. Smith has against the State of Florida or any of its political subdivisions, officials, 16 17 employees, or agents, or against the Broward County Sheriff's Office or any of its officials, employees, or agents, arising 18 19 from the conviction, sentence, and incarceration of Frank Lee 20 Smith in the Shandra Whitehead case. The Comptroller is directed to draw his 21 Section 3. warrant in favor of the estate of Frank Lee Smith in the sum 22 of \$3.5 million out of funds in the General Revenue Fund not 23 otherwise appropriated, and the Treasurer is directed to pay 24 25 the same out of such funds. Section 4. This act shall take effect July 1, 2001. 26 27 28 29 30 31

SENATE SUMMARY Provides an appropriation to compensate the estate of Frank Lee Smith for Mr. Smith's having been the victim of a miscarriage of justice. Provides for a waiver of any claims by the estate against the state or the Broward County Sheriff's Office or any subdivisions, agents, or employees of either entity.