2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

1011

1213

1415

1617

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2627

28

29

By the Committee on Rules; and Senator Simmons

595-03288-18 20181316c1

A bill to be entitled An act relating to the Uniform Voidable Transactions Act; providing a directive to the Division of Law Revision and Information; amending s. 726.101, F.S.; revising a short title; amending s. 726.102, F.S.; revising and providing definitions; amending s. 726.103, F.S.; removing conditions under which a partnership is insolvent; imposing the burden of proving insolvency upon certain debtors; amending ss. 726.105 and 726.106, F.S.; imposing the burden of proving elements of a claim for relief upon certain creditors; providing legislative intent regarding certain comments issued by the Uniform Law Commission; amending s. 726.107, F.S.; conforming provisions to changes made by the act; amending s. 726.108, F.S.; providing conditions under which attachments or other provisional remedies are available to creditors; amending s. 726.109, F.S.; revising the parties subject to judgments for recovery of a creditor's claim; revising conditions under which a transfer is not voidable; imposing the burden of proving certain applicability, claim elements, and adjustments; providing requirements for standard of proof; amending ss. 726.110, 726.111, and 726.112, F.S.; conforming provisions to changes made by the act; creating s. 726.113, F.S.; providing that claims for relief are governed by specified claims law; creating s. 726.114, F.S.; providing definitions; providing applicability of specified provisions for series organizations and

595-03288-18 20181316c1

the protected series of such organizations; creating s. 726.115, F.S.; providing applicability for a

specified federal act; providing an effective date.

323334

30

31

Be It Enacted by the Legislature of the State of Florida:

3536

37

38 39

40

41

42

4344

4546

47

48 49

50

51

52

53

54

5556

57

58

Section 1. The Division of Law Revision and Information is directed to rename chapter 726, Florida Statutes, entitled "FRAUDULENT TRANSFERS," as "VOIDABLE TRANSACTIONS."

Section 2. Section 726.101, Florida Statutes, is amended to read:

726.101 Short title.—This act may be cited as the "Uniform Voidable Transactions Fraudulent Transfer Act."

Section 3. Section 726.102, Florida Statutes, is amended to read:

726.102 Definitions.—As used in this chapter ss. 726.101—726.112:

- (1) "Affiliate" means:
- (a) A person that who directly or indirectly owns, controls, or holds with power to vote, 20 percent or more of the outstanding voting securities of the debtor, other than a person that who holds the securities:
- 1. As a fiduciary or agent without sole discretionary power to vote the securities; or
- 2. Solely to secure a debt, if the person has not  $\underline{\text{in fact}}$  exercised the power to vote.
- (b) A corporation 20 percent or more of whose outstanding voting securities are directly or indirectly owned, controlled, or held with power to vote, by the debtor or a person that  $\frac{1}{2}$

60

61

62 63

64

65

66 67

68

69

70

71

72

7374

75

76

77

78

79

80

8182

83

8485

86

87

595-03288-18 20181316c1

directly or indirectly owns, controls, or holds, with power to vote, 20 percent or more of the outstanding voting securities of the debtor, other than a person that who holds the securities:

- 1. As a fiduciary or agent without sole <u>discretionary</u> power to vote the securities; or
- 2. Solely to secure a debt, if the person has not in fact exercised the power to vote.
- (c) A person whose business is operated by the debtor under a lease or other agreement, or a person substantially all of whose assets are controlled by the debtor; or
- (d) A person  $\underline{\text{that}}$  who operates the debtor's business under a lease or other agreement or controls substantially all of the debtor's assets.
- (2) "Asset" means property of a debtor, but the term does not include:
- (a) Property to the extent it is encumbered by a valid lien:
- (b) Property to the extent it is generally exempt under nonbankruptcy law; or
- (c) An interest in property held in tenancy by the entireties to the extent it is not subject to process by a creditor holding a claim against only one tenant.
- (3) "Charitable contribution" means a charitable contribution as that term is defined in s. 170(c) of the Internal Revenue Code of 1986, if that contribution consists of:
- (a) A financial instrument as defined in s. 731(c)(2)(C) of the Internal Revenue Code of 1986; or
  - (b) Cash.
  - (4) "Claim," except as used in "claim for relief," means a

89

90 91

92

93

94

95

96 97

98

99

100101

102

103

104

105

106

107

108

111

112113

114115

116

595-03288-18 20181316c1

right to payment, whether or not the right is reduced to judgment, liquidated, unliquidated, fixed, contingent, matured, unmatured, disputed, undisputed, legal, equitable, secured, or unsecured.

- (5) "Claims law" means fraudulent conveyance, fraudulent transfer, or voidable transfer laws or other laws of similar effect.
  - (6) "Creditor" means a person that who has a claim.
  - (7) "Debt" means liability on a claim.
- (8) "Debtor" means a person that who is liable on a claim.
- (9) "Electronic" means technology having electrical, digital, magnetic, wireless, optical, electromagnetic, or similar capabilities.
  - (10) <del>(8)</del> "Insider" includes:
  - (a) If the debtor is an individual:
- 1. A relative of the debtor or of a general partner of the debtor;
  - 2. A partnership in which the debtor is a general partner;
- 3. A general partner in a partnership described in subparagraph 2.; or
- 4. A corporation of which the debtor is a director, officer, or person in control;
  - (b) If the debtor is a corporation:
  - 1. A director of the debtor;
  - 2. An officer of the debtor;
  - 3. A person in control of the debtor;
  - 4. A partnership in which the debtor is a general partner;
  - 5. A general partner in a partnership described in

595-03288-18 20181316c1

117 subparagraph 4.; or

118

119120

121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130131

132

133

134

135

136

137

138

139

140

141142

143

144

145

- 6. A relative of a general partner, director, officer, or person in control of the debtor.
  - (c) If the debtor is a partnership:
  - 1. A general partner in the debtor;
- 2. A relative of a general partner in, a general partner of, or a person in control of the debtor;
- 3. Another partnership in which the debtor is a general partner;
- 4. A general partner in a partnership described in this paragraph subparagraph 3.; or
  - 5. A person in control of the debtor.
- (d) An affiliate, or an insider of an affiliate as if the affiliate were the debtor.
  - (e) A managing agent of the debtor.
- (11) (9) "Lien" means a charge against or an interest in property to secure payment of a debt or performance of an obligation, and includes a security interest created by agreement, a judicial lien obtained by legal or equitable process or proceedings, a common-law lien, or a statutory lien.
- (12) "Organization" means a person other than an individual.
- (13) (10) "Person" means an individual, partnership, <u>limited</u> partnership, <u>business</u> corporation, <u>nonprofit business</u> corporation, <u>public</u> corporation, <u>limited liability company</u>, <u>limited cooperative association, unincorporated nonprofit</u> association, <u>organization</u>, government or governmental subdivision, <u>instrumentality</u>, or agency, business trust, <u>common law business trust</u>, statutory trust, estate, trust, <u>association</u>,

147

148

149

150

151152

153

154

155156

157

158

159

160

161

162

163

164

165

166

167

168169

170171

172

173

174

595-03288-18 20181316c1

joint venture, or any other legal or commercial entity.

- $\underline{(14)}$  "Property" means anything that may be the subject of ownership.
- $\underline{\text{(15)}}$  "Qualified religious or charitable entity or organization" means:
- (a) An entity described in s. 170(c)(1) of the Internal Revenue Code of 1986; or
- (b) An entity or organization described in s. 170(c)(2) of the Internal Revenue Code of 1986.
- (16) "Record" means information that is inscribed on a tangible medium or that is stored in an electronic or other medium and is retrievable in perceivable form.
- (17) (13) "Relative" means an individual related by consanguinity within the third degree as determined by the common law, a spouse, or an individual related to a spouse within the third degree as so determined, and includes an individual in an adoptive relationship within the third degree.
- (18) "Sign" means with present intent to authenticate or adopt a record to:
  - (a) Execute or adopt a tangible symbol; or
- (b) Attach to or logically associate with the record an electronic symbol, sound, or process.
- (19) (14) "Transfer" means every mode, direct or indirect, absolute or conditional, voluntary or involuntary, of disposing of or parting with an asset or an interest in an asset, and includes payment of money, release, lease, license, and creation of a lien or other encumbrance.
- $\underline{\text{(20)}}$  "Valid lien" means a lien that is effective against the holder of a judicial lien subsequently obtained by

595-03288-18 20181316c1

legal or equitable process or proceedings.

Section 4. Section 726.103, Florida Statutes, is amended to read:

726.103 Insolvency.-

- (1) A debtor is insolvent if, at a fair valuation, the sum of the debtor's debts is greater than the sum all of the debtor's assets at a fair valuation.
- (2) A debtor that who is generally not paying their his or her debts as they become due for reasons other than as a result of a bona fide dispute is presumed to be insolvent. The party against which the presumption is directed, has the burden of proving that the nonexistence of insolvency is more probable than its existence.
- (3) A partnership is insolvent under subsection (1) if the sum of the partnership's debts is greater than the aggregate, at a fair valuation, of all of the partnership's assets and the sum of the excess of the value of each general partner's nonpartnership assets over the partner's nonpartnership debts.
- (3) (4) Assets under this section do not include property that has been transferred, concealed, or removed with intent to hinder, delay, or defraud creditors or that has been transferred in a manner making the transfer voidable under this chapter ss. 726.101-726.112.
- $\underline{(4)}$  (5) Debts under this section do not include an obligation to the extent it is secured by a valid lien on property of the debtor not included as an asset.
- Section 5. Section 726.105, Florida Statutes, is amended to read:
  - 726.105 Transfers or obligations voidable fraudulent as to

206

207

208

209

210

211

212213

214

215

216

217

218

219

220

221

222

223

224

225

226

227

228229

230

231

232

595-03288-18 20181316c1

present and future creditors.-

(1) A transfer made or obligation incurred by a debtor is voidable fraudulent as to a creditor, whether the creditor's claim arose before or after the transfer was made or the obligation was incurred, if the debtor made the transfer or incurred the obligation:

- (a) With actual intent to hinder, delay, or defraud any creditor of the debtor; or
- (b) Without receiving a reasonably equivalent value in exchange for the transfer or obligation, and the debtor:
- 1. Was engaged or was about to engage in a business or a transaction for which the remaining assets of the debtor were unreasonably small in relation to the business or transaction; or
- 2. Intended to incur, or believed or reasonably should have believed that  $\underline{\text{the debtor}}$   $\underline{\text{he or she}}$  would incur, debts beyond  $\underline{\text{the}}$  debtor's  $\underline{\text{his or her}}$  ability to pay as they became due.
- (2) In determining actual intent under paragraph (1)(a), consideration may be given, among other factors, to whether:
  - (a) The transfer or obligation was to an insider.
- (b) The debtor retained possession or control of the property transferred after the transfer.
  - (c) The transfer or obligation was disclosed or concealed.
- (d) Before the transfer was made or obligation was incurred, the debtor had been sued or threatened with suit.
- (e) The transfer was of substantially all the debtor's assets.
  - (f) The debtor absconded.
  - (g) The debtor removed or concealed assets.

595-03288-18 20181316c1

(h) The value of the consideration received by the debtor, including value by way of asset substitution or otherwise, was reasonably equivalent to the value of the asset transferred or the amount of the obligation incurred.

- (i) The debtor was insolvent or became insolvent shortly after the transfer was made or the obligation was incurred.
- (j) The transfer occurred shortly before or shortly after a substantial debt was incurred.
- (k) The debtor transferred the essential assets of the business to a lienor  $\underline{\text{that}}$  who transferred the assets to an insider of the debtor.
- (3) A creditor making a claim for relief under subsection
  (1) has the burden of proving the elements of the claim for relief by a preponderance of the evidence.

Section 6. It is the intent of the Legislature that the Uniform Law Commission's comments two and eight to section four of the Uniform Voidable Transactions Act, as amended in 2014, may not be persuasive authority in interpreting s. 726.105, Florida Statutes. Instead, the courts of this state must look to all relevant and applicable law when interpreting s. 726.105, Florida Statutes.

Section 7. Section 726.106, Florida Statutes, is amended to read:

- 726.106 Transfers  $\underline{\text{or obligations voidable}}$   $\underline{\text{fraudulent}}$  as to present creditors.—
- (1) A transfer made or obligation incurred by a debtor is voidable fraudulent as to a creditor whose claim arose before the transfer was made or the obligation was incurred if the debtor made the transfer or incurred the obligation without

595-03288-18 20181316c1

receiving a reasonably equivalent value in exchange for the transfer or obligation and the debtor was insolvent at that time or the debtor became insolvent as a result of the transfer or obligation.

- (2) A transfer made by a debtor is <u>voidable</u> fraudulent as to a creditor whose claim arose before the transfer was made if the transfer was made to an insider for an antecedent debt, the debtor was insolvent at that time, and the insider had reasonable cause to believe that the debtor was insolvent.
- (3) Subject to s. 726.103(2), a creditor making a claim for relief under subsection (1) or subsection (2) has the burden of proving the elements of the claim for relief by a preponderance of the evidence.

Section 8. Section 726.107, Florida Statutes, is amended to read:

726.107 When transfer made or obligation incurred.—For the purposes of this chapter ss. 726.101-726.112:

- (1) A transfer is made:
- (a) With respect to an asset that is real property other than a fixture, but including the interest of a seller or purchaser under a contract for the sale of the asset, when the transfer is so far perfected that a good faith purchaser of the asset from the debtor against which whom applicable law permits the transfer to be perfected cannot acquire an interest in the asset that is superior to the interest of the transferee.
- (b) With respect to an asset that is not real property or that is a fixture, when the transfer is so far perfected that a creditor on a simple contract cannot acquire a judicial lien otherwise than under this chapter ss. 726.101-726.112 that is

595-03288-18 20181316c1

superior to the interest of the transferee.

- (2) If applicable law permits the transfer to be perfected as provided in subsection (1) and the transfer is not so perfected before the commencement of an action for relief under this chapter ss. 726.101-726.112, the transfer is deemed made immediately before the commencement of the action.
- (3) If applicable law does not permit the transfer to be perfected as provided in subsection (1), the transfer is made when it becomes effective between the debtor and the transferee.
- (4) A transfer is not made until the debtor has acquired rights in the asset transferred.
  - (5) An obligation is incurred:
- (a) If oral, when it becomes effective between the parties; or
- (b) If evidenced by a <u>record</u> writing, when the <u>record</u> signed writing executed by the obligor is delivered to or for the benefit of the obligee.
- Section 9. Section 726.108, Florida Statutes, is amended to read:

726.108 Remedies of creditors.-

- (1) In an action for relief against a transfer or obligation under <u>this chapter</u> ss. 726.101-726.112, a creditor, subject to the limitations in s. 726.109 may obtain:
- (a) Avoidance of the transfer or obligation to the extent necessary to satisfy the creditor's claim, including as contemplated by s. 605.0503(7)(b);
- (b) An attachment or other provisional remedy against the asset transferred or other property of the transferee  $\underline{\text{if}}$  available under  $\underline{\text{in accordance with}}$  applicable law;

595-03288-18 20181316c1

(c) Subject to applicable principles of equity and in accordance with applicable rules of civil procedure:

- 1. An injunction against further disposition by the debtor or a transferee, or both, of the asset transferred or of other property;
- 2. Appointment of a receiver to take charge of the asset transferred or of other property of the transferee; or
  - 3. Any other relief the circumstances may require.
- (2) If a creditor has obtained a judgment on a claim against the debtor, the creditor, if the court so orders, may levy execution on the asset transferred or its proceeds.

Section 10. Section 726.109, Florida Statutes, is amended to read:

726.109 Defenses, liability, and protection of transferee or obligee.—

- (1) A transfer or obligation is not voidable under s. 726.105(1)(a) against a person that  $\frac{1}{2}$  took in good faith and for a reasonably equivalent value given the debtor or against any subsequent transferee or obligee.
- (2) (a) Except as otherwise provided in this section, To the extent a transfer is voidable in an action by a creditor under s. 726.108(1)(a), the creditor may recover judgment for the value of the asset transferred, as adjusted under subsection (3), or the amount necessary to satisfy the creditor's claim, whichever is less. The judgment may be entered against:
- $\underline{\text{1.(a)}}$  The first transferee of the asset or the person for whose benefit the transfer was made; or
- <u>2.(b)</u> An immediate or mediate transferee of the first Any subsequent transferee other than:

595-03288-18 20181316c1

<u>a.</u> A good faith transferee <u>that</u> who took for value; or

- <u>b. An immediate or mediate good faith transferee of a person described in sub-subparagraph a from any subsequent transferee.</u>
- (b) Recovery pursuant to s. 726.108(1)(a) or (2) of or from the asset transferred or its proceeds, by levy or otherwise, is available only against a person described in subparagraph (a)1. or subparagraph(a)2.
- (3) If the judgment under subsection (2) is based upon the value of the asset transferred, the judgment must be for an amount equal to the value of the asset at the time of the transfer, subject to adjustment as the equities may require.
- (4) Notwithstanding voidability of a transfer or an obligation under this chapter ss. 726.101-726.112, a good faith transferee or obligee is entitled, to the extent of the value given the debtor for the transfer or obligation, to:
- (a) A lien on or a right to retain  $\underline{an}$  any interest in the asset transferred;
  - (b) Enforcement of an any obligation incurred; or
- (c) A reduction in the amount of the liability on the judgment.
- (5) A transfer is not voidable under s. 726.105(1)(b) or s. 726.106 if the transfer results from:
- (a) Termination of a lease upon default by the debtor when the termination is pursuant to the lease and applicable law; or
- (b) Enforcement of a security interest in compliance with Article 9 of the Uniform Commercial Code other than acceptance of collateral in full or partial satisfaction of the obligation it secures.

595-03288-18 20181316c1

- (6) A transfer is not voidable under s. 726.106(2):
- (a) To the extent the insider gave new value to or for the benefit of the debtor after the transfer was made, except to the extent unless the new value was secured by a valid lien;
- (b) If made in the ordinary course of business or financial affairs of the debtor and the insider; or
- (c) If made pursuant to a good faith effort to rehabilitate the debtor and the transfer secured present value given for that purpose as well as an antecedent debt of the debtor.
- (7) (a) The transfer of a charitable contribution that is received in good faith by a qualified religious or charitable entity or organization is not a <u>voidable</u> fraudulent transfer under s. 726.105(1) (b) or s. 726.106(1).
- (b) However, a charitable contribution from a natural person is a <u>voidable fraudulent</u> transfer if the transfer was received on, or within 2 years before, the earlier of the date of commencement of an action under this chapter, the filing of a petition under the federal Bankruptcy Code, or the commencement of insolvency proceedings by or against the debtor under any state or federal law, including the filing of an assignment for the benefit of creditors or the appointment of a receiver, unless:
- 1. The transfer was consistent with the practices of the debtor in making the charitable contribution; or
- 2. The transfer was received in good faith and the amount of the charitable contribution did not exceed 15 percent of the gross annual income of the debtor for the year in which the transfer of the charitable contribution was made.
  - (8) (a) A party that seeks to invoke subsection (1),

408

409

410

411

412

413

414

415

416

417

418

419

420

421

422423

424425

426

427

428

429

430

431432

435

595-03288-18 20181316c1

subsection (4), subsection (5), or subsection (6) has the burden of proving the applicability of that subsection.

- (b) Except as otherwise provided in paragraphs (c) and (d), the creditor has the burden of proving each applicable element of subsection (2) or subsection (3).
- (c) The transferee has the burden of proving the applicability to the transferee under subparagraph (2)(a)2.
- (d) A party that seeks adjustment under subsection (3) has the burden of proving the adjustment.
- (9) The standard of proof required to establish matters referred to in this section is preponderance of the evidence.

Section 11. Section 726.110, Florida Statutes, is amended to read:

- 726.110 Extinguishment of <u>claim for relief</u> cause of action.—A <u>claim for relief</u> cause of action with respect to a <u>fraudulent</u> transfer or obligation under <u>this chapter</u> ss.

  726.101-726.112 is extinguished unless action is brought:
- (1) Under s. 726.105(1)(a), within 4 years after the transfer was made or the obligation was incurred or, if later, within 1 year after the transfer or obligation and its wrongful nature was or could reasonably have been discovered by the claimant;
- (2) Under s. 726.105(1)(b) or s. 726.106(1), within 4 years after the transfer was made or the obligation was incurred; or
- (3) Under s. 726.106(2), within 1 year after the transfer was made or the obligation was incurred.
- Section 12. Section 726.111, Florida Statutes, is amended to read:
  - 726.111 Supplementary provisions.—Unless displaced by the

595-03288-18 20181316c1

provisions of this chapter ss. 726.101-726.112, the principles of law and equity, including the law merchant and the law relating to principal and agent, estoppel, laches, fraud, misrepresentation, duress, coercion, mistake, insolvency, or other validating or invalidating cause, supplement those provisions.

Section 13. Section 726.112, Florida Statutes, is amended to read:

726.112 Uniformity of application and construction.—Chapter 87-79, Laws of Florida, shall be applied and construed to effectuate its general purpose to make uniform the law with respect to the subject of the law among states enacting the law it.

Section 14. Section 726.113, Florida Statutes, is created to read:

726.113 Governing law.-

- (1) For the purposes of this section, the following provisions shall determine a debtor's physical location:
- (a) A debtor that is an individual is located at his or her principal residence.
- (b) A debtor that is an organization and has only one place of business is located at its place of business.
- (c) A debtor that is an organization and has more than one place of business is located at its chief executive office.
- (2) A claim for relief in the nature of a claim for relief under this chapter is governed by the claims law of the jurisdiction in which the debtor is located when the transfer is made or the obligation is incurred.
  - (3) This section only applies to determine the claims law

595-03288-18 20181316c1

governing a claim for relief under this chapter. This section does not affect the governing law for any other claims, issues, or relief between the parties arising outside of this chapter.

(4) If this section requires the application of the claims law of a foreign jurisdiction, such a determination does not affect which jurisdiction's exemption laws apply, the availability of exemptions under applicable law, or the debtor's entitlement to any protections afforded to the debtor's homestead under the Florida Constitution.

Section 15. Section 726.114, Florida Statutes, is created to read:

- 726.114 Application to series organization.-
- (1) As used in this section, the term:
- (a) "Protected series" means an arrangement, however denominated, created by a series organization that, pursuant to the law under which the series organization is organized, meets the criteria set forth in paragraph (b).
- (b) "Series organization" means an organization that, pursuant to the law under which it is organized, has the following characteristics:
- 1. The organic record of the organization provides for creation by the organization of one or more protected series, however denominated, with respect to specified property of the organization, and for records to be maintained for each protected series that identify the property of, or associated with, the protected series.
- 2. Debt incurred or existing with respect to the activities of, or property of or associated with, a particular protected series is enforceable against the property of or associated with

595-03288-18 20181316c1

the protected series only, and not against the property of or associated with the organization or other protected series of the organization.

- 3. Debt incurred or existing with respect to the activities or property of the organization is enforceable against the property of the organization only, and not against the property of or associated with a protected series of the organization.
- (2) A series organization and each protected series of the organization is a separate person for purposes of this chapter, even if for other purposes a protected series is not a person separate from the organization or other protected series of the organization. Provisions of law other than this chapter determines whether and to what extent a series organization and each protected series of the organization is a separate person for purposes other than the purposes of this chapter.

Section 16. Section 726.115, Florida Statutes, is created to read:

National Commerce Act.—This chapter modifies, limits, and supersedes the federal Electronic Signatures in Global and National Commerce Act, 15 U.S.C. ss. 7001, et seq., but does not modify, limit, or supersede section 101(c) of that act, 15 U.S.C. s. 7001(c), or authorize electronic delivery of any of the notices described in s. 103(b) of that act, 15 U.S.C. s. 7003(b).

Section 17. This act shall take effect July 1, 2018.