

The Florida Senate
BILL ANALYSIS AND FISCAL IMPACT STATEMENT

(This document is based on the provisions contained in the legislation as of the latest date listed below.)

Prepared By: The Professional Staff of the Committee on Governmental Oversight and Accountability

BILL: SB 1634

INTRODUCER: Senators Brodeur and Ausley

SUBJECT: Public Records/Aquaculture/Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services

DATE: March 29, 2021

REVISED: _____

	ANALYST	STAFF DIRECTOR	REFERENCE	ACTION
1.	<u>Becker</u>	<u>Becker</u>	<u>AG</u>	Favorable
2.	<u>Candelaria</u>	<u>McVaney</u>	<u>GO</u>	Pre-meeting
3.	_____	_____	<u>RC</u>	_____

I. Summary:

SB 1634 makes confidential and exempt from public inspection and copying requirements certain aquaculture records held by the Department of Agriculture and Consumer Service. The confidential and exempt records include shellfish receiving and production records generated by shellfish processing facilities, audit records and supporting documentation required for submerged land leases, and aquaculture production records and receipts generated by aquaculture facilities. A record may be disclosed to another governmental entity in the performance of its duties and responsibilities. This exemption applies to aquaculture records held before, on, or after July 1, 2021.

This exemption is subject to the Open Government Sunset Review Act and shall stand repealed on October 2, 2026, unless reviewed and saved from repeal by the Legislature.

The bill provides a statement of public necessity as required by the State Constitution.

Because the bill creates a new public records exemption and expands other public records exemptions, it requires a two-thirds vote of the members present and voting in each house of the Legislature for final passage.

The bill takes effect July 1, 2021.

II. Present Situation:

Access to Public Records - Generally

The Florida Constitution provides that the public has the right to inspect or copy records made or received in connection with official governmental business.¹ The right to inspect or copy applies to the official business of any public body, officer, or employee of the state, including all three branches of state government, local governmental entities, and any person acting on behalf of the government.²

Additional requirements and exemptions related to public records are found in various statutes and rules, depending on the branch of government involved. For instance, section 11.0431, Florida Statutes (F.S.), provides public access requirements for legislative records. Relevant exemptions are codified in s. 11.0431(2)-(3), F.S., and the statutory provisions are adopted in the rules of each house of the legislature.³ Florida Rule of Judicial Administration 2.420 governs public access to judicial branch records.⁴ Lastly, chapter 119, F.S., provides requirements for public records held by executive agencies.

Executive Agency Records – The Public Records Act

Chapter 119, F.S., known as the Public Records Act, provides that all state, county and municipal records are open for personal inspection and copying by any person, and that providing access to public records is a duty of each agency.⁵

A public record includes virtually any document or recording, regardless of its physical form or how it may be transmitted.⁶ The Florida Supreme Court has interpreted the statutory definition of “public record” to include “material prepared in connection with official agency business which is intended to perpetuate, communicate, or formalize knowledge of some type.”⁷

The Florida Statutes specify conditions under which public access to public records must be provided. The Public Records Act guarantees every person’s right to inspect and copy any public record at any reasonable time, under reasonable conditions, and under supervision by the

¹ FLA. CONST. art. I, s. 24(a).

² *Id.*

³ See Rule 1.48, *Rules and Manual of the Florida Senate*, (2018-2020) and Rule 14.1, *Rules of the Florida House of Representatives*, Edition 2, (2018-2020)

⁴ *State v. Wooten*, 260 So. 3d 1060 (Fla. 4th DCA 2018).

⁵ Section 119.01(1), F.S. Section 119.011(2), F.S., defines “agency” as “any state, county, district, authority, or municipal officer, department, division, board, bureau, commission, or other separate unit of government created or established by law including, for the purposes of this chapter, the Commission on Ethics, the Public Service Commission, and the Office of Public Counsel, and any other public or private agency, person, partnership, corporation, or business entity acting on behalf of any public agency.”

⁶ Section 119.011(12), F.S., defines “public record” to mean “all documents, papers, letters, maps, books, tapes, photographs, films, sound recordings, data processing software, or other material, regardless of the physical form, characteristics, or means of transmission, made or received pursuant to law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business by any agency.”

⁷ *Shevin v. Byron, Harless, Schaffer, Reid and Assoc., Inc.*, 379 So. 2d 633, 640 (Fla. 1980).

custodian of the public record.⁸ A violation of the Public Records Act may result in civil or criminal liability.⁹

The Legislature may exempt public records from public access requirements by passing a general law by a two-thirds vote of both the House and the Senate.¹⁰ The exemption must state with specificity the public necessity justifying the exemption and must be no broader than necessary to accomplish the stated purpose of the exemption.¹¹

General exemptions from the public records requirements are contained in the Public Records Act.¹² Specific exemptions often are placed in the substantive statutes relating to a particular agency or program.¹³

When creating a public records exemption, the Legislature may provide that a record is “exempt” or “confidential and exempt.” Custodians of records designated as “exempt” are not prohibited from disclosing the record; rather, the exemption means that the custodian cannot be compelled to disclose the record.¹⁴ Custodians of records designated as “confidential and exempt” may not disclose the record except under circumstances specifically defined by the Legislature.¹⁵

Open Government Sunset Review Act

The Open Government Sunset Review Act¹⁶ (the Act) prescribes a legislative review process for newly created or substantially amended¹⁷ public records or open meetings exemptions, with specified exceptions.¹⁸ It requires the automatic repeal of such exemption on October 2nd of the fifth year after creation or substantial amendment, unless the Legislature reenacts the exemption.¹⁹

The Act provides that a public records or open meetings exemption may be created or maintained only if it serves an identifiable public purpose and is no broader than is necessary.²⁰

⁸ Section 119.07(1)(a), F.S.

⁹ Section 119.10, F.S. Public records laws are found throughout the Florida Statutes, as are the penalties for violating those laws.

¹⁰ FLA. CONST. art. I, s. 24(c).

¹¹ *Id. See, e.g., Halifax Hosp. Medical Center v. News-Journal Corp.*, 724 So. 2d 567 (Fla. 1999) (holding that a public meetings exemption was unconstitutional because the statement of public necessity did not define important terms and did not justify the breadth of the exemption); *Baker County Press, Inc. v. Baker County Medical Services, Inc.*, 870 So. 2d 89 (Fla. 1st DCA 2004) (holding that a statutory provision written to bring another party within an existing public records exemption is unconstitutional without a public necessity statement).

¹² *See, e.g., s. 119.071(1)(a), F.S.* (exempting from public disclosure examination questions and answer sheets of examinations administered by a governmental agency for the purpose of licensure).

¹³ *See, e.g., s. 213.053(2)(a), F.S.* (exempting from public disclosure information contained in tax returns received by the Department of Revenue).

¹⁴ *See Williams v. City of Minneola*, 575 So. 2d 683, 687 (Fla. 5th DCA 1991).

¹⁵ *WFTV, Inc. v. The School Board of Seminole*, 874 So. 2d 48 (Fla. 5th DCA 2004).

¹⁶ Section 119.15, F.S.

¹⁷ An exemption is considered to be substantially amended if it is expanded to include more records or information or to include meetings as well as records. Section 119.15(4)(b), F.S.

¹⁸ Section 119.15(2)(a) and (b), F.S., provide that exemptions that are required by federal law or are applicable solely to the Legislature or the State Court System are not subject to the Open Government Sunset Review Act.

¹⁹ Section 119.15(3), F.S.

²⁰ Section 119.15(6)(b), F.S.

An exemption serves an identifiable purpose if it meets one of the following purposes *and* the Legislature finds that the purpose of the exemption outweighs open government policy and cannot be accomplished without the exemption:

- It allows the state or its political subdivisions to effectively and efficiently administer a governmental program, and administration would be significantly impaired without the exemption;²¹
- It protects sensitive, personal information, the release of which would be defamatory, cause unwarranted damage to the good name or reputation of the individual, or would jeopardize the individual's safety. If this public purpose is cited as the basis of an exemption, however, only personal identifying information is exempt;²² or
- It protects information of a confidential nature concerning entities, such as trade or business secrets.²³

In examining an exemption, the Act directs the Legislature to carefully question the purpose and necessity of reenacting the exemption. The Act requires the Legislature to consider the following specific questions in such a review:²⁴

- What specific records or meetings are affected by the exemption?
- Whom does the exemption uniquely affect, as opposed to the general public?
- What is the identifiable public purpose or goal of the exemption?
- Can the information contained in the records or discussed in the meeting be readily obtained by alternative means? If so, how?
- Is the record or meeting protected by another exemption?
- Are there multiple exemptions for the same type of record or meeting that it would be appropriate to merge?

If the exemption is continued and expanded, then a public necessity statement and a two-thirds vote for passage are required.²⁵ If the exemption is continued without substantive changes or if the exemption is continued and narrowed, then a public necessity statement and a two-thirds vote for passage are *not* required. If the Legislature allows an exemption to sunset, the previously exempt records will remain exempt unless provided for by law.²⁶

Aquaculture Records Held by the Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services

The Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services (department) is Florida's lead aquaculture agency. The department coordinates and assists in the development of aquaculture and regulates aquafarms to protect and conserve Florida's natural resources. There are an estimated 1,500 species or varieties of fish, plants, mollusks, crustaceans, and reptiles grown in the state.²⁷

²¹ Section 119.15(6)(b)1., F.S.

²² Section 119.15(6)(b)2., F.S.

²³ Section 119.15(6)(b)3., F.S.

²⁴ Section 119.15(6)(a), F.S.

²⁵ See generally s. 119.15, F.S.

²⁶ Section 119.15(7), F.S.

²⁷ See <https://www.fdacs.gov/Divisions-Offices/Aquaculture> (Last visited March 10, 2021).

Currently, aquaculture producers are required to provide the department with receiving logs, production volume records, inventories, and receipts and invoices related to their aquaculture facilities to ensure compliance with the terms and conditions of sovereign submerged land lease agreements and aquaculture best management practices. These records include information, such as quantity and price of seed stock purchased and harvest times which, if released, could be detrimental to their businesses. Information regarding products, harvest times, and locations make aquaculture businesses susceptible to theft, particularly with respect to sovereign submerged land leases in remote locations. Because these required records are public, potential aquaculture producers may make the decision not to operate in this state. This makes the department's regulating and monitoring responsibilities more difficult and hinders its efforts to continue developing Florida's aquaculture industry.

The department has indicated that there is a significant precedent for the exemption of private sales and production information for agriculture and fisheries products. The aquaculture information which is proposed to become exempt under this bill was, in fact, exempt under s. 397.362(6), F.S., until 1998 when the Florida Game and Freshwater Fish Commission was reorganized, including its aquaculture regulatory authority. After the formation of the Florida Fish and Wildlife Conservation Commission (FWC), authority for the regulation of marine life was redistributed between the department, the FWC, and the Department of Environmental Protection. The public records exemption was transferred along with other statutory authority to the FWC but was not specifically added for the records held by the department.²⁸

III. Effect of Proposed Changes:

Section 1 creates s. 597.0042, F.S., to make certain aquaculture records required by the department confidential and exempt from public inspection and copying requirements. The confidential and exempt records include shellfish receiving and production records generated by shellfish processing facilities, audit records and supporting documentation required for submerged land leases, and aquaculture production records and receipts generated by aquaculture facilities. This exemption applies to aquaculture records held before, on, or after July 1, 2021.

This section is subject to the Open Government Sunset Review Act and shall stand repealed on October 2, 2026, unless reviewed and saved from repeal by the Legislature.

Section 2 provides legislative intent that it is a public necessity that certain production records related to aquaculture and shellfish facilities held by the department are exempt from Florida's public records laws. Without this exemption, the department may be hindered from obtaining valuable and accurate information. With this exemption, the department can protect the aquaculture industry and its facilities while maintaining compliance with federal partners and documenting the compliance of aquaculture producers with statutory requirements.

Section 3 provides that the bill takes effect July 1, 2021.

²⁸ See Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services, Bill Analysis for SB 1634 (March 4, 2021) (on file with the Senate Committee on Agriculture).

IV. Constitutional Issues:**A. Municipality/County Mandates Restrictions:**

Not applicable. The mandate restrictions do not apply because the bill does not require counties and municipalities to spend funds, reduce counties' or municipalities' ability to raise revenue, or reduce the percentage of state tax shared with counties and municipalities.

B. Public Records/Open Meetings Issues:***Vote Requirement***

Article I, s. 24(c) of the State Constitution requires a two-thirds vote of the members present and voting for final passage of a bill creating or expanding an exemption to the public records requirements. This bill enacts a new exemption for the private sales and production information for aquaculture businesses, thus, the bill requires a two-thirds vote to be enacted.

Public Necessity Statement

Article I, s. 24(c) of the State Constitution requires a bill creating or expanding an exemption to the public records requirements to state with specificity the public necessity justifying the exemption. Section 2 of the bill contains a statement of public necessity for the exemption. The bill asserts that, in the absence of the exemption, the department may be hindered from obtaining valuable and accurate information due to the nature of the industry and its inability to maintain confidentiality of information that is required by Florida law. With this exemption, the department can protect this industry and its facilities while maintaining compliance with federal partners and documenting the compliance of aquaculture producers with statutory requirements.

Breadth of Exemption

Article I, s. 24(c) of the State Constitution requires an exemption to the public records requirements to be no broader than necessary to accomplish the stated purpose of the law. The purpose of the law is to protect private aquaculture business information, to make facilities theft more difficult, and to enable the department to more efficiently monitor the industry. This bill exempts the following from the public records requirements:

- Shellfish receiving and production records generated by shellfish processing facilities;
- Audit records and supporting documentation required for submerged land leases; and
- Aquaculture production records and receipts generated by certified aquaculture facilities.

The exemption does not appear to be broader than necessary to accomplish the purpose of the law.

C. Trust Funds Restrictions:

None.

D. State Tax or Fee Increases:

None.

E. Other Constitutional Issues:

None identified.

V. Fiscal Impact Statement:

A. Tax/Fee Issues:

None.

B. Private Sector Impact:

The private sector will be subject to the cost associated with an agency making redactions in response to a public records request.

C. Government Sector Impact:

The department will incur minor costs relating to the redaction of exempt records.

VI. Technical Deficiencies:

None.

VII. Related Issues:

None.

VIII. Statutes Affected:

This bill substantially amends section 597.0042 of the Florida Statutes.

IX. Additional Information:

A. Committee Substitute – Statement of Changes:

(Summarizing differences between the Committee Substitute and the prior version of the bill.)

None.

B. Amendments:

None.

This Senate Bill Analysis does not reflect the intent or official position of the bill's introducer or the Florida Senate.
