The Florida Senate BILL ANALYSIS AND FISCAL IMPACT STATEMENT

(This document is based on the provisions contained in the legislation as of the latest date listed below.)

	Prepare	ed By: The	Professional Sta	ff of the Committee	on Criminal Jus	tice
BILL:	SB 1086					
INTRODUCER:	Senator Gr	uters				
SUBJECT:	Rights of Law Enforcement Officers					
DATE:	March 10,	2023	REVISED:			
ANALYST		STAF	F DIRECTOR	REFERENCE		ACTION
1. Cellon		Stokes	;	CJ	Favorable	
2.	<u>.</u>	'		GO		
3.				RC		

I. Summary:

SB 1086 amends provisions contained in part VI of ch. 112, F.S., commonly referred to as the "Law Enforcement Officer's Bill of Rights." The bill provides for an additional right, and permits a law enforcement officer or a correctional officer who is under consideration for disciplinary action by his or her agency to seek redress, if the agency fails to follow the disciplinary process in the "Officer's Bill of Rights" and related statutes.¹

The bill amends s. 112.532, F.S., to provide that if an agency undertakes disciplinary action, suspension, demotion, or dismissal against a law enforcement officer or a correctional officer, the officer must receive notice within 180 days after the agency receives notice of the alleged misconduct when none of the specified tolling exceptions² apply. If the agency does not comply with the notice provision, and an officer is disciplined, suspended, demoted, or dismissed, the bill provides that the officer may appeal the issuance of the disciplinary action administratively or in a court of competent jurisdiction.

Additionally, the bill amends s. 112.534, F.S., to convey upon the officer a right to appeal administratively or in a court of competent jurisdiction if a violation of s. 112.534, F.S., is discovered after an interview or interrogation, or if the agency fails to abide by the Law Enforcement Officer's Bill of Rights, and related provisions.³

Law enforcement agencies and the Department of Corrections may incur additional costs of litigation as a result of the bill's provisions although the fiscal impact is unquantifiable.

The bill becomes effective July 1, 2023.

¹ Part VI of ch. 112, F.S.

² Section 112.532(6)(a), F.S.; See footnote 7 for a complete list of the exceptions.

³ Part VI of ch. 112, F.S.; See ss. 112.531-112.535, F.S.

II. Present Situation:

Law Enforcement Officers' Bill of Rights

Section 112.532, F.S., commonly known as the "Law Enforcement Officers' Bill of Rights" provides specific rights when a law enforcement officer or a correctional officer is under investigation and subject to interrogation for a reason which could lead to a disciplinary action, demotion, or dismissal. These rights generally include:

- The right to be informed of the nature of the investigation and the evidence against the law enforcement officer or correctional officer before any interrogation;
- The right to counsel during any interrogation;
- The right to be notified of the reasons for any disciplinary action before it is imposed;
- The right to a transcript of any interrogation;
- The right to a complete copy of the investigatory file; and
- The right to address the findings in the investigatory report with the agency before the disciplinary action is imposed.⁴

Additionally, these rights provide the conditions under which any interrogation of the officer must be conducted, including limitations on the time, place, manner, and length of the interrogation, and restriction on the interrogation techniques.⁵

Notice of Disciplinary Action

A dismissal, demotion, transfer, reassignment, or other personnel action that might result in loss of pay or benefits or that might otherwise be considered a punitive measure may not be taken against any law enforcement officer or correctional officer unless the law enforcement officer or correctional officer is notified of the action and the reason or reasons for the action before the effective date of the action.⁶

No disciplinary action, demotion, or dismissal may be taken unless the investigation is completed within 180 days of receipt of a notice of a complaint against an officer. Notice to the officer must be provided within 180 days after the date the agency received notice of the alleged misconduct, by a person authorized by the agency to initiate an investigation, regardless of the origin of the allegation or complaint. If the agency determines that disciplinary action is appropriate, it shall complete its investigation and give notice in writing to the law enforcement officer or correctional officer of its intent to proceed with disciplinary action, along with a proposal of the specific action sought, including length of suspension, if applicable.

⁴ Section 112.532(1)(a), (1)(b), (1)(c), (1)(e), and (1)(f), F.S.

⁵ Section 112.532(1)(d), (1)(g), (1)(i), (4)(a), and (4)(b), F.S.

⁶ Section 112.532(4)(a), F.S.

⁷ Section 112.532(6), F.S.

⁸ Section 112.532(6)(a), F.S.

⁹ Note that s. 112.532(6)(a)1.-6., F.S., contains certain exceptions to the 180-day limitation on completing an investigation. The running of the limitations period may be tolled for a period specified in a written waiver of the limitation by the law enforcement officer or correctional officer. The running of the limitations period is tolled during the time that any criminal investigation or prosecution is pending in connection with the act, omission, or other allegation of misconduct. If the investigation involves an officer who is incapacitated or otherwise unavailable, the running of the limitations period is tolled during the period of incapacitation or unavailability. In a multijurisdictional investigation, the limitations period may be

An investigation against a law enforcement officer or correctional officer may be reopened if significant new evidence has been discovered that is likely to affect the outcome of the investigation, and such evidence could not have reasonably been discovered in the normal course of the investigation or the evidence resulted from the predisciplinary response of the officer. Such an investigation must be completed within 90 days after the date it was reopened.¹⁰

Agency Non-Compliance

Section 112.534, F.S., provides a method of recourse for an officer who alleges that any law enforcement agency or correctional agency, including investigators in its internal affairs or professional standards division, or an assigned investigating supervisor, intentionally failed to comply with the requirements of Part VI of ch. 112, F.S., related to an investigation of a complaint against that officer.¹¹

The officer must advise the investigator of the intentional violation of the requirements of this part which is alleged to have occurred. The officer's notice of violation is sufficient to notify the investigator of the requirements of this part which are alleged to have been violated and the factual basis of each violation.¹²

If the investigator fails to cure the violation or continues the violation after being notified by the law enforcement officer or correctional officer, the officer shall request the agency head or his or her designee be informed of the alleged intentional violation. Once this request is made, the interview of the officer shall cease, and the officer's refusal to respond to further investigative questions does not constitute insubordination or any similar type of policy violation. ¹⁴

Thereafter, within 3 working days, a written notice of violation and request for a compliance review hearing shall be filed with the agency head or designee that must contain sufficient information to identify the requirements of part VI of ch. 112, F.S., which are alleged to have been violated and the factual basis of each violation. All evidence related to the investigation must be preserved for review and presentation at the compliance review hearing. For purposes of confidentiality, the compliance review panel hearing shall be considered part of the original investigation.¹⁵

Unless otherwise remedied by the agency before the hearing, a compliance review hearing must be conducted within 10 working days after the request for a compliance review hearing is filed,

extended for a period of time reasonably necessary to facilitate the coordination of the agencies involved. The running of the limitations period may be tolled for emergencies or natural disasters during the time period wherein the Governor has declared a state of emergency within the jurisdictional boundaries of the concerned agency. The running of the limitations period is tolled during the time that the officer's compliance hearing proceeding is continuing beginning with the filing of the notice of violation and a request for a hearing and ending with the written determination of the compliance review panel or upon the violation being remedied by the agency.

¹⁰ Section 112.532(6)(b), F.S.

¹¹ Part VI of ch. 112, F.S., pertains to law enforcement and correctional officers. See ss. 112.531-112.535, F.S.

¹² Section 112.534(1)(a), F.S.

¹³ Section 112.534(1)(b), F.S.

¹⁴ Id.

¹⁵ Section 112.534(1)(c), F.S.

unless, by mutual agreement of the officer and agency or for extraordinary reasons, an alternate date is chosen. The compliance review panel shall review the circumstances and facts surrounding the alleged intentional violation.¹⁶

Section 112.534(1)(d), F.S., sets forth the composition of compliance review panels, which hold compliance review hearings when requested by an officer with a complaint.¹⁷ It is the responsibility of the compliance review panel to determine whether the investigator or agency intentionally violated the requirements provided under part VI of ch. 112, F.S. The panel may hear evidence, review relevant documents, and hear argument before making a determination. All evidence received shall be strictly limited to the allegation under consideration and may not be related to the disciplinary charges pending against the officer.¹⁸ The officer bears the burden of proof in the hearing. The determination of the panel must be made at the conclusion of the hearing, in writing, and filed with the agency head and the officer.¹⁹

If the alleged violation is sustained as intentional by the compliance review panel, the agency head shall immediately remove the investigator from any further involvement with the investigation of the officer. Additionally, the agency head shall direct an investigation be initiated against the investigator for purposes of agency disciplinary action. If that investigation is sustained, the sustained allegations against the investigator shall be forwarded to the Criminal Justice Standards and Training Commission for review as an act of official misconduct or misuse of position.²⁰

Although the aggrieved officer may seek redress through the compliance review panel process under the circumstances described above, it appears that other avenues of complaint are unavailable. For example, s. 112.534(2)(b), F.S., specifies that the provisions of ch. 120, F.S., "do not apply" to part VI of ch. 112, F.S. Chapter 120, F.S., is the Administrative Procedure Act. This statutory prohibition against an officer seeking relief in the administrative law system became effective on July 1, 2009.

In the same 2009 law, the following language was stricken from s. 112.534(g), F.S.: "[A] law enforcement officer or correctional officer employed by or appointed to such agency who is personally injured by such failure to comply may apply directly to the circuit court of the county wherein such agency is headquartered and permanently resides for an injunction to restrain and

¹⁶ Section 112.534(1)(d), F.S.

¹⁷ The compliance review panel shall be made up of three members: one member selected by the agency head, one member selected by the officer filing the request, and a third member to be selected by the other two members. The review panel members shall be law enforcement officers or correctional officers who are active from the same law enforcement discipline as the officer requesting the hearing. Panel members may be selected from any state, county, or municipal agency within the county in which the officer works.

¹⁸ Section 112.534(1)(e), F.S.

¹⁹ Section 112.534(1)(f), F.S.

²⁰ Section 112.534(1)(g), F.S. The Criminal Justice Standards and Training Commission is authorized to certify, and revoke the certification of officers, instructors, including agency in-service training instructors, and criminal justice training schools. Section 943.12(3), F.S. "Officer" means any person employed or appointed as a full-time, part-time, or auxiliary law enforcement officer, correctional officer, or correctional probation officer. Section 943.10(14), F.S.

²¹ Chapter 120, F.S., is the Administrative Procedure Act.

²² Chapter 2009-200, L.O.F.

enjoin such violation of the provisions of this part and to compel the performance of the duties imposed by this part."²³

III. Effect of Proposed Changes:

The bill amends provisions contained in part VI of ch. 112, F.S., commonly referred to as the "Law Enforcement Officer's Bill of Rights." The bill provides for an additional right, and permits a law enforcement officer or a correctional officer who is under consideration for disciplinary action by his or her agency to seek redress, if the agency fails to follow the disciplinary process in the "Officer's Bill of Rights" and related statutes. ²⁴

The bill amends s. 112.532, F.S., to provide that if an agency undertakes disciplinary action, suspension, demotion, or dismissal against a law enforcement officer or a correctional officer, the officer must receive notice within 180 days after the agency receives notice of the alleged misconduct when none of the specified tolling exceptions, ²⁵ apply.

If the agency does not comply with the notice provision, and an officer is disciplined, suspended, demoted, or dismissed, the bill provides that the officer may appeal the issuance of the disciplinary action administratively or in a court of competent jurisdiction.

Additionally, the bill amends s. 112.534, F.S., to convey upon the officer a right to appeal administratively or in a court of competent jurisdiction if a violation of s. 112.534, F.S., is discovered after an interview or interrogation, or if the agency fails to abide by the Law Enforcement Officer's Bill of Rights, and related provisions.²⁶

The bill, therefore, gives an officer options for redress if the officer believes he or she has been wronged in the disciplinary process that were not available since the law was changed in 2009.

Law enforcement agencies and the Department of Corrections may incur additional costs of litigation as a result of the bill's provisions although the fiscal impact is unquantifiable.

The bill becomes effective July 1, 2023.

IV. Constitutional Issues:

A.	Municipality/County	Mandates	Restrictions:

B. Public Records/Open Meetings Issues:

None.

None.

 $^{^{23}}$ *Id*.

²⁴ Part VI of ch. 112, F.S.

²⁵ Section112.532(6)(a), F.S.; See footnote 7 for a complete list of the exceptions.

²⁶ Part VI of ch. 112, F.S.; See ss. 112.531-112.535, F.S.

	C.	Trust Funds	Restrictions:
--	----	-------------	---------------

None.

D. State Tax or Fee Increases:

None.

E. Other Constitutional Issues:

None identified.

V. Fiscal Impact Statement:

A. Tax/Fee Issues:

None.

B. Private Sector Impact:

None.

C. Government Sector Impact:

Law enforcement agencies and the Department of Corrections may incur additional costs of litigation although the fiscal impact is unquantifiable.

VI. Technical Deficiencies:

None.

VII. Related Issues:

None.

VIII. Statutes Affected:

This bill substantially amends the following sections of the Florida Statutes: 112.532 and 112.534.

IX. Additional Information:

A. Committee Substitute – Statement of Changes:

(Summarizing differences between the Committee Substitute and the prior version of the bill.)

None.

B.	Δn	nend	Ime	nts:

None.

This Senate Bill Analysis does not reflect the intent or official position of the bill's introducer or the Florida Senate.